

DIRECTORATE-GENERAL FOR INTERNAL POLICIES

POLICY DEPARTMENT **C**
CITIZENS' RIGHTS AND CONSTITUTIONAL AFFAIRS



Constitutional Affairs	
Justice, Freedom and Security	
Gender Equality	
Legal and Parliamentary Affairs	
Petitions	

Democratic scrutiny, transparency,
and modalities of vote in the
National Parliaments of the
Member States and in the
European Parliament

NOTE



DIRECTORATE GENERAL FOR INTERNAL POLICIES
POLICY DEPARTMENT C: CITIZENS' RIGHTS AND
CONSTITUTIONAL AFFAIRS

CONSTITUTIONAL AFFAIRS

**Democratic scrutiny, transparency, and
modalities of vote in the National
Parliaments of the Member States and in
the European Parliament**

STUDY

Abstract

This comparative note looks at modern parliaments from the perspective of transparency, accessibility and accountability of their activities to the general public. The subsequent tables comprise the basic voting modalities and transparency measures employed in the European Parliament, national Parliaments of the EU Member States and of some non-EU countries, as well as in the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe.

The electronic version of the present note allows accessing relevant background information via [hyperlinks](#) (national parliaments' Rules of Procedure, websites, etc.).

Keywords: modalities of vote, democratic accountability, transparency

This document was requested by the European Parliament's Committee Constitutional Affairs.

AUTHOR

Dr Izabela Jędrzejowska, Institut für Europäische Verfassungswissenschaften,
Fernuniversität Hagen

The study was produced on the basis contributions from national correspondents of the European Centre for Parliamentary Research and Documentation (ECPRD)



RESPONSIBLE ADMINISTRATOR

Mr Petr Novak
Policy Department Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs
European Parliament
B-1047 Brussels
E-mail: poldep-citizens@europarl.europa.eu

LINGUISTIC VERSIONS

Original: EN

ABOUT THE EDITOR

To contact the Policy Department or to subscribe to its monthly newsletter please write to:
poldep-citizens@europarl.europa.eu

European Parliament, manuscript completed in November 2012.
Brussels, © European Union, 2012.

This document is available on the Internet at:
<http://www.europarl.europa.eu/studies>

DISCLAIMER

The opinions expressed in this document are the sole responsibility of the author and do not necessarily represent the official position of the European Parliament.

Reproduction and translation for non-commercial purposes are authorized, provided the source is acknowledged and the publisher is given prior notice and sent a copy.

CONTENTS

RESUME	4
1. BACKGROUND	5
1.1. Parliaments and their democratic functions	5
1.2. The concept of a “democratic” parliament	5
2. THE AIM AND APPROACH ADOPTED IN THE ANALYSIS	7
3. OBSERVABLE TENDENCIES	8
3.1. The policy of openness	8
3.2. The methods of voting applied by parliaments and their impact on the transparency of individual votes of MPs/ MEPs	9
3.3. Transparency of the legislative process	10
4. CONCLUSIONS	11
5. OVERVIEW OF PARLIAMENTARY VOTING MODALITIES	13
5.1. The European Parliament	13
5.2. Voting methods in the national parliaments of EU Member States	15
5.3. Voting methods in selected parliaments of non-EU states	46
5.4. The Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe	53
6. TRANSPARENCY AND DEMOCRATIC RESPONSIBILITY	54
6.1. State of the art in the European Parliament	54
6.2. Transparency measures in the national parliaments of the EU Member States	55
6.3. TRANSPARENCY MEASURES IN SELECTED PARLIAMENTS OF NON-EU STATES	73
6.4. Measures employed by the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe	77
REFERENCES	78

RESUME

La présente étude examine les **systèmes de vote** au sein des parlements nationaux des États membres de l'UE et du Parlement européen, ainsi que dans certains pays non-membres et dans d'autres organisations internationales, comme l'Assemblée parlementaire du Conseil de l'Europe. Elle analyse également **les moyens utilisés pour garantir la transparence et assurer la communication** par lesquels l'électorat et le public en général sont à même d'évaluer le travail législatif ainsi que d'autres activités parlementaires en exerçant ainsi leur contrôle démocratique sur leurs représentants.

L'analyse des informations disponibles sur la manière dont les parlements organisent leurs procédures internes de décision et des moyens utilisés par eux pour assurer le caractère public des débats et des votes peut être utile afin **d'identifier les meilleures pratiques** et de **fournir une série d'arguments dans le contexte d'initiatives visant à la réforme parlementaire**.

Du point de vue des citoyens et de leurs attentes légitimes de participation, la modalité de vote fournissant le maximum d'information sur le comportement de vote de leurs représentants élus est **le vote par appel nominal**. Compte tenu des différences qui existent entre les pratiques parlementaires, «vote par appel nominal» est entendu comme un vote où le résultat numérique global ainsi que les votes individuellement exprimés par les députés sont enregistrés et rendus publics. Cette procédure revêt son importance considérant l'intérêt du public à ce que les positions politiques prises par les députés qui conduisent à l'adoption d'actes législatifs soient rendues transparentes. Les parlements appliquent la ladite procédure par un vote électronique, *viva voce* ou selon d'autres pratiques parlementaire traditionnelles. Fondamentalement, cette option correspond à **une tendance observable dans un grand nombre des parlements nationaux** des États membres de l'UE où les questions considérées *prima facie* comme nécessitant un haut niveau de transparence sont soumises à un vote par appel nominal (au moins dans 20 parlements le vote par appel nominal est généralement utilisé pour des votes importants ou de nature législative).

Il est également important de reconnaître le rôle que **les technologies de l'information et de la communication** peuvent jouer dans la mise en œuvre et l'amélioration de la transparence et de la participation démocratique des citoyens. A titre d'exemple, des sites Internet parlementaires fournissant des informations détaillées et régulièrement mises à jour sur la conduite des affaires et assurant le caractère public des débats parlementaires par le biais de la diffusion en direct sur Internet contribuent à cette fin.

Il convient de noter que la notion **d'accessibilité du Parlement** est beaucoup plus complexe que l'accès des citoyens à ses travaux et documents. Le débat sur la démocratie participative, pourra conduire à examiner au niveau national et européen l'opportunité de mesures concrètes visant à la mise en œuvre d'une élaboration des décisions **"du bas vers le haut"** (par exemple, au moyen d'une implication des citoyens dès le stade préparatoire du processus législatif). Dans ce contexte, la question se pose si les parlements sont prêts à examiner l'option de faire usage de nouvelles formes de communication interactive avec les citoyens.

Par ailleurs, on constate des différences non seulement entre les modèles de représentation que les différents parlements ont retenu, mais également des écarts entre les modèles qu'ont choisis les différents partis politiques. Chaque modèle implique d'autres canaux pour la représentation politique et les liens avec les citoyens.

1. BACKGROUND

1.1. Parliaments and their democratic functions

In the European constitutional tradition, parliaments are political institutions the central function of which is legislation, budgetary matters and supervision of the executive. The effectiveness with which parliaments carry out their constitutional and statutory competences is instrumental in ensuring the desirable quality of legitimacy in the democratic process. It is by and large by way of the parliamentary arena that the polyphony of views and interests through open debates, controversial votes and negotiated compromise solutions comes to the surface of a given political space.

As democratically constituted fora for political deliberation and decision-making, modern parliaments play a crucial role in the development and evolution of representative democracy at national and European levels. In their composition and discourse, parliaments do not only reflect political, social and cultural configurations of their respective electoral background, but they also contribute to (re)shaping these configurations linguistically and rhetorically.¹ This specific *Deutungsmacht*² (semantic/interpretative power) of Parliaments manifests itself primarily through their legislative competence. Therefore, it is of paramount importance that in their mode of operation Parliaments remain open, accessible and thus allowing the general public to hold their elected representatives to account.

1.2. The concept of a “democratic” parliament

While acknowledging the sovereignty of constitutional orders and the autonomy of parliaments which imply the necessary variety in the organisation of parliamentary work within the European political space, it is also legitimate to question whether there are certain common features and standards to which modern parliaments should aspire in order to render their activities more transparent and subject to public scrutiny. According to the IPU’s (Inter-Parliamentary Union) guide to good practice *Parliament and democracy in the twenty-first century*³, as cited and further elaborated on by *World e-Parliament Report 2008*, United Nations (2008), distinct characteristics of a “democratic” parliament may be defined as follows:

- **representative**, which means an elected parliament that is socially and politically representative of the diversity of the people, and committed to equal opportunities for all its members so that they can carry out their mandates;
- **transparent**, that is open to the public sphere through different media and thus transparent in the conduct of its business;

¹ Cf. Ilie, C. (2010), *European Parliaments under Scrutiny. Discourse strategies and interaction practices*, John Benjamins Publishing Company, Amsterdam/ Philadelphia, p. 1.

² Patzelt, W.J., Ch.Demuth, S.Dreischer, R. Messerschmidt, R. Schirmer, (2005), „Institutionelle Macht. Kategorien ihrer Analyse und Erklärung“, in: Patzelt, W.J. (ed.), *Parlamente und ihre Macht. Kategorien und Fallbeispiele institutioneller Analyse*, Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden, p. 38.

³ *Parliament and democracy in the twenty-first century: A guide to good practice*, Inter-Parliamentary Union, 2006.

- **accessible**, that is involving the public, including civil society movements and associations, in the work of parliament (e.g. public participation in pre-legislative process, notably through open consultations with the interested parties);
- **accountable**, which entails members of parliament being accountable to the electorate and citizenry at large for their performance in office and integrity of conduct;
- **effective**, which involves effective organisation of business as well as performance of parliament's legislative and scrutiny functions in accordance with the said democratic norms and values. With regard to local/ regional and international levels, effectiveness requires active and cooperative involvement in the work of legislatures also in those contexts.

A survey on the relevant information of how the parliaments make use of their autonomy within their respective constitutional framework when organising their own decision-making procedures may provide a working tool for parliamentary decision-makers, be useful for identifying best practices and provide a source of arguments for or against initiatives aiming at parliamentary reform.

2. THE AIM AND APPROACH ADOPTED IN THE ANALYSIS

The aim of the present note is to provide a general overview of the voting traditions existing in national parliaments of the EU Member States and the European Parliament, as well as means of transparency and communication by which the electorate and the public at large are put in a position to assess the democratic scrutiny and other parliamentary activities. The note presents also the state of the art in selected non-EU states, as well as international organisation(s), as exemplified by the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe.

The approach adopted in the analysis focuses on the following aspects:

- Voting modalities applied by parliaments as well as the control of the regularity of voting procedure and results by relevant services;
- Means of ensuring public character of debates and votes, notably with regard to the legislative process;
- The possibility for the electorate to check what their elected representatives declared and how they voted;
- Electronic voting system and/ or other means of adjusting parliaments to the modern information technology.

Thus the main objective of the study is not an overview of parliamentary voting and deliberation practices *per se*, but rather whether and to what extent those practices render the parliamentary procedures more open, transparent and allow for holding the decision-makers to account for the manner in which they carry out their functions.

3. OBSERVABLE TENDENCIES

3.1. The policy of openness

Democratic scrutiny and transparency, as well as public participation in the democratic life are conditioned upon the policy of openness implemented by parliaments. In other words, it is both the accessibility and quality of information available regarding Parliament's conduct of business to MPs/ MEPs, parliamentary administration, media and general public that determines the extent to which transparency and opportunities for citizens participation are realised within a given political context. Therefore, it is vital to recognise the role information and communication technologies (ICT) may play in supporting and upgrading the standards of accountability, transparency and democratic participation of citizens.

The overview of parliamentary practices in the EU Member States, the European Parliament, as well as other parliamentary chambers subject to the present analysis allows the following observations:

- Parliaments tend to adjust to modern information technology and use ICT tools thus rendering their data easily accessible via their websites, which provide detailed and regularly updated information on the conduct of business, notably of the legislative process;
- In principle plenary sessions of Parliaments are open to the public, which does not preclude some Chambers reserving the right to hold debates on selected subjects in camera. The general practice is that parliaments ensure public character of debates via webstreaming and/ or broadcasting the proceedings live on television. Moreover, Parliaments normally reserve a certain number of seats (the visitors tribune) for visitors wishing to follow the debate in the hemicycle;
- Depending on the Member State, committee meetings are either open to the public or held behind closed doors. In contrast, except for coordinators' meetings, the public character of the European Parliament's committee meetings is in practice on a par with that of the plenary sessions, albeit exceptionally committees may decide to declare a meeting (or a part of a meeting) to be held in camera;
- Parliamentary websites allow interested parties and general public verification of statements and declarations made by Members (e.g. audiovisual recording of proceedings);
- Given the complexity of casting and counting ballots, electronic vote has become a prevailing practice which allows for and is largely used for making the information about the individual voting public. Where electronic voting system is not applied, parliaments ensure control of voting results, notably by the responsible office holders, officials or services.

3.2. The methods of voting applied by parliaments and their impact on the transparency of individual votes of MPs/ MEPs

Among the voting methods applied by the national parliaments of the EU Member States and the European Parliament, the one providing the most information about the individual voting behaviour is the roll call vote.

Since parliamentary Rules of Procedure and practices tend to differ in their understanding of the concept of the roll call, for the purpose of this study, the **roll-call vote** is construed as any type of vote the results of which are nominally and numerically recorded. In other words, it is a vote organised in such a manner that enables to register both the quantified overall result of the vote, as well as the way in which each individual vote is cast.

The analysis of the voting modalities applied by the EU Member States reveals that **electronic voting** is a popular method of taking a simultaneous roll call (only six national parliaments of the EU Member States⁴ do not apply this method, nor do they use e-voting system for other types of vote. On the other hand, on the basis of the available information it can be established that at least in 20 parliaments the roll call vote is usually applied for important or legislative votes. Interestingly, while presently there are no facilities for electronic voting available in the Austrian Parliament, parliamentary Rules of Procedure provide for this type of voting if electronic facilities were available. An opposite phenomenon may be observed in Greece where, although an e-voting system has been installed, it is not being used). However, a roll call does not necessarily require an electronic voting device. Other means of carrying out a roll call include *inter alia* votes cast *viva voce* (verbal voting), voting by means of official ballots or voting cards bearing MPs names.

From the perspective of the electorate and its legitimate participatory claims, the advantages of the roll call are obvious. The nominal record of the voting results is the best way for citizens to check how their elected representatives act. This enables them to hold their representatives to account at subsequent elections. Incidentally, some research on the relationship between the mode and accuracy of voting concludes that ballot style makes a substantial difference in individuals' abilities to translate their voting intentions into a vote.⁵ By way of example, individuals tend to vote more accurately on a voting system that has a review screen.⁶ On the other hand, it could be argued that public record may impel the voting member to privilege reasons of party or political group discipline over his own personal choices.

Whenever the electronic voting system is a usual or foreseen modality of taking votes and it may not be used due to technical problems, other methods are employed, such as e.g. voting by show of hands or rising and sitting.

Regarding the vote by **show of hands**, its results are normally registered in terms of a decision in favour, against and abstentions and no record of individual votes. The reason

⁴ These are: Austria, Cyprus, Germany, Greece, the Netherlands and the UK. In addition, also the upper chamber of the French parliament (Senate) does not take votes by electronic means. However, the analysis of the data concerning bicameral parliaments of the EU Member States usually does not reveal considerable differences in voting modalities between two chambers of the same Parliament.

⁵ Herrnson, P.S. *et al* (2008), *Voting Technology. The Not-So-Simple Act of Casting a Ballot*, Brookings Institution Press, Washington D.C., pp. 73 ff.

⁶ *Op.cit.*, p. 72.

for that is normally technical and entails ensuring a smooth and swift carrying out of a complex vote. In case of doubt as to the result, parliaments (and their committees, where this modality is even more frequent than in plenary) usually resort to an electronic check. In some Member States where this method is applied with the simultaneous use of the vote counting machine, the results are nominally and numerically recorded (e.g. Hungary and Poland). Generally, voting by a show of hands is regarded as **an open vote** since the public may follow the proceedings e.g. through webstreaming, albeit in practice the possibilities for observing how individual Members vote are very limited.

To sum up, not all national parliaments of the EU Member States dispose of (fully developed) electronic voting systems. Nevertheless, e-voting is not a condition sine qua non of individual record of votes since parliaments may and do carry out roll calls according to their various traditional voting modalities.

3.3. Transparency of the legislative process

A generally observable tendency in national parliaments of the EU Member states is that matters considered prima facie as requiring considerable transparency are subjected to a roll call vote. This may induce a reflection whether it would be preferable to apply in particular to the legislative process voting modalities which are as open as possible.

Under the European Parliament's Rules of Procedure, final legislative votes are always roll call votes (Rule 166). The same applies to the election of the Commission (it should be noted that pursuant to Rule 105 the election of the Commission President takes place by secret ballot) and a vote on a motion for censure of the Commission (Rules 106 and 107).

The need for a high transparency of the political positions taken by Members in votes on legislative acts is as a matter of principle also recognized by numerous national parliaments, the minimum standard of which should be a compulsory roll call in final votes on legislation.

Moreover, parliamentary rules of procedure usually provide for an opportunity to hold a roll call upon a motion by a given number of MPs, frequently additionally conditioned upon support for such a motion expressed in a vote.

4. CONCLUSIONS

Parliaments are not only uniquely positioned to **implement the values of transparency and accountability** in relation to the public sphere, but also **contribute to and inspire the democratic process**, including its participatory dimension.

From the perspective of the citizens and their legitimate participatory expectations, **the voting modality providing the most information about their elected representatives' voting behaviour is the roll call vote**. Having regard to the interest of the general public in ensuring high transparency of the political positions taken by Members which lead to the adoption of legislative acts, a reflection may be put forth whether **in particular to the legislative process** it would be preferable for parliaments to apply the roll call (taken electronically, *viva voce* or according to other traditional parliamentary practices).

It is of paramount importance to recognise **the role information and communication technologies (ICT)** may play in **supporting and upgrading the standards of accountability, transparency and democratic participation of citizens**. Properly designed parliamentary websites providing detailed and regularly updated information on the conduct of business, notably the legislative process, and ensuring public character of plenary and committee level debates via webstreaming beyond doubt contribute to that end.

It should be noted, however, that **the concept of parliament's accessibility is much more comprehensive than citizens' access to its proceedings and documents**. In more precise terms, the aspect which to date enjoys only but limited visibility – despite its arguable capacity of fostering the general public's participation in the democratic life – is the active **involvement of the citizenry in the bottom-up policy-making process** (e.g. by means of public participation in pre-legislative process or experimenting with new forms of interactive communication with citizens). Interesting in this regard is the parliamentary dimension which has been given to the European citizens' initiative by providing, in Regulation No 211/2011⁷ for a need to organise in the European Parliament a hearing for any successful initiative.

In this context the question arises to what extent parliaments resort to **interactive ICT tools** in order to seek to implement these values and objectives. On the other hand, it should be noted that patterns of representation differ not only from parliament to parliament, but substantial discrepancies may also be observed between party types, with each type offering different channels of political representation and linkages to citizens⁸, not to mention individual initiatives of MPs and MEPs providing links to their personal websites.

⁷ Regulation (EU) No 211/2011 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 16 February 2011 on the citizens' initiative, OJ L 65, 11.3.2011, p.1.

⁸ Ezrow, L. (2004), *Linking Citizens to Parties. How Electoral Systems Matter for Political Representation*, Oxford University Press, New York, p. 5.

It should be noted that in the absence of relevant data the present note could not investigate more deeply into the above raised issues pertaining to bottom-up policy-making, which may potentially be instrumental to the quality of the democratic process, by motivating involvement and political concern among the citizenry..

5. OVERVIEW OF PARLIAMENTARY VOTING MODALITIES

5.1. The European Parliament

European Parliament	Show hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
<u>General overview</u>	In show of hands, neither individual votes of MEPs nor numerical results are recorded; only the decision in favour or against.	1. E-voting as a technical means to facilitate voting by show of hands; the numerical result is recorded; 2. E-voting with a nominal record of individual votes ("roll call vote").	The roll-call vote may be carried out according to two modalities: 1. <u>electronic vote</u> 2. <u>roll call vote by using paper ballots</u> , if the electronic system failed.	Yes	–	Control of results is the duty of the responsible services of the General Secretariat of the European Parliament, under the supervision of the political authorities. In the case of
<u>Plenary:</u>	Final votes are always recorded numerically.	Electronic voting is used where the President so decides; it is carried out as a roll call vote when a political group or at least 40 Members so request.	Final legislative votes are always roll call votes (Rule 166 of the Rules of Procedure). The same applies for the election of the Commission and a vote on a	It is used in the case of appointments. ⁹ Voting may also be by secret ballot if this is requested by at least one-fifth of the component Members of Parliament. Such requests must be made before voting begins. A request for a secret ballot shall	–	appointments, candidates do not act as tellers of secret ballot votes.

⁹ Elections of the EP's President, Vice-Presidents, Quaestors (Rule 13) and the Commission President (Rule 105).

<p><u>Committees:</u></p>	<p>Final votes are always recorded numerically.</p>	<p>The decision how to vote is at the discretion of the Chair.</p>	<p>motion for censure of the Commission.(Rules 106 and 107). At the request of a quarter of committee Members (Rule 195).</p>	<p>take priority over a request for a vote by roll call (Rule 169). Applied in the case of appointments (Rule 169).</p>	<p>—</p>	
<p><u>Political groups:</u></p>	<p>The decision how to vote is at the discretion of the Chair.</p>			<p>Applied in the case of appointments.</p>	<p>—</p>	

5.2. Voting methods in the national parliaments of EU Member States

Member State Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
Austria (Nationalrat and Bundesrat)	Voting by show of hands is open for the public but individual votes are not recorded.	There are no facilities for electronic voting in the Austrian Parliament (Nationalrat and Bundesrat) so far, albeit § 66 point 2 of the Rules of Procedure provides for this type of voting if electronic facilities were available.	<u>Voting by name:</u> 1. <u>by means of official ballots</u> which bear names of MPs and have different colours depending on whether marked "yes" or "no". MPs are called by name and place their ballots in one ballot box, those voting being counted; ¹⁰ 2. <u>vote cast viva voce</u> , on decision of the President,	The votes are cast by means of official ballots marked "yes"/ "no". The voting modalities are the same as in the roll-call vote ¹¹ , but MPs can fill in their ballots and place them in the requisite	Voting by rising or remaining seated Voting by the members rising from their seats or remaining seated is a rule.	Control of results is the duty of the President of the chamber. In case of roll call votes it is the duty of the whips.

¹⁰ Voting by name may be applied – at the discretion of the President - from the start or if the result of a vote appears doubtful. It is also held where at least 20 Members so demand in writing before the voting procedure is commenced.

¹¹ The National Council may decide, upon the proposal of the President or upon a motion of 20 Members, that a secret ballot be held, except where voting by name has been demanded.

			with MPs being called up in alphabetical order and responding by "yes" or "no".	envelope in a booth without being observed.		
--	--	--	---	---	--	--

Member State Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
<p>Belgium</p> <p>House of Representatives</p>	<p>Used only in committee.</p>	<p>Used for over 50 years: “yes, no and abstention” buttons for each member. Results are displayed and recorded by name (there is no secret ballot via electronic vote). Exception: if the Speaker simply uses the ‘electronic’ voting equipment to double-check the result of a sitting and standing vote, the result is not recorded by name.</p>	<p>The nominal vote by call-over Members (verbal voting, in the past also voting by ‘signed voting ballots’, nowadays using the e-voting system) in final votes on laws, motions of confidence, motions of presentation and (constructive) motions of no-confidence. A nominal vote may also be held if a request to that end is made by one Member and supported by at least eight MPs.</p>	<p>Applied in the case of nomination and election of candidates; paper ballots and a ballot box are used.</p>	<p>Voting by sitting and standing in cases in which the Rules of Procedure of the House of Representatives explicitly prescribe it as well as in all other cases where the nominal vote is not required.</p>	<p>The result of the vote is checked and confirmed by the President and the Secretaries, and published in the <i>Verbatim Report</i>.</p> <p>With nominal voting, votes and abstentions cast by Members are published in the <i>Verbatim Report</i>.</p>

¹² Votes on motions submitted at the conclusion of a debate, votes on the findings of a committee report, votes on amendments and individual articles of a bill, and votes on a proposed decision not to amend a draft bill as voted by the House of Representatives.

Senate	Applied in committee meetings, with the results of the votes being recorded numerically.	In all cases where the Rules of Procedure (Article 44(3)) provide for a roll call vote (all final legislative votes; at the Chair's discretion for any vote except in cases where a secret ballot is required and in specific cases ¹² at the request of five Members.	Electronic voting and voting by signed paper ballots are both equated with a roll call vote. In parliamentary practice, a vote by roll call will only occur should the electronic system fail. Signed paper ballots are no longer used.	Applied in the case of election and nomination of candidates.	A rising vote ("voting by sitting and standing") as the default voting method.	See the rules for the House of Representatives.
Bulgaria	Applied as an open vote.	Electronic voting: 1. without nominal record of results; 2. with the Members' names and votes shown on the screen through the computerized voting system (roll call).	Roll-call by: 1. using the electronic system 2. calling the names of Members of the National Assembly with replies of 'yes', 'no' and 'abstained'. ¹³	Secret vote is taken by ballot papers.	Open vote by signatures.	The Chairperson and the Secretaries of the National Assembly ascertain the regularity of the voting procedure and the control of voting results.

¹³ Both modalities of roll call, the open vote by signatures and the secret ballot may be requested by a Parliamentary Group or not less than one tenth of all Members of the National Assembly. Such motion is put to the vote without a debate. One Member of each Parliamentary Groups objecting to such a motion shall be recognised.

Member State Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
Croatia ¹⁴	Applied as an open vote.	The results of e-voting are visible on the screen which displays name and vote of each member.	Conducted when it is sought by a deputy club or the sponsor of a bill. Moreover, the modalities of e-voting are equivalent to the roll call.	Applied in the cases specified by the Standing Orders of the Croatian Parliament	–	The chair ascertains if a decision received the required majority of votes and proclaims the result of the vote. He/she orders a renewed count at the request of a deputy (such a verification must be sought before the chair establishes that an individual decision is passed). In vote by raising hands, counting is made by Parliamentary Staff, whereas in roll call vote by the Secretary of Parliament.
Cyprus House of Representatives	MPs names are not recorded but only the number of positive and negative votes, as well as abstentions.	Not applicable.	Not applicable.	–	–	Regarding the Plenary, under Rule 10 of the House of Representatives Rules of Procedure, <i>the Clerks (who are Members of Parliament)</i> assist the President in conducting the proceedings of the House, including the voting time, and write down the decisions taken.

¹⁴ To become an EU Member State as of 1st July 2013 provided that all the instruments of ratification to the Accession Treaty are deposited by this time (Article 3 Section 3 of the Accession Treaty).

Member State Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
<p>Czech Republic</p> <p>Chamber of Deputies</p>	<p>This method is usually used when the Chamber's electronic voting system is not used.</p>	<p>Deputies vote through the Chamber's voting system, except when otherwise provided by the law or unless the Chamber approves another form of polling. The Chamber's voting system provides a configuration showing how the individual Deputies voted.</p>	<p>1. <u>Voting by names</u>. Individual Deputies called in an alphabetic order should respond "for the petition", "against the petition" or "abstaining". Every answer is repeated by the chairperson. All other actions of Deputies are regarded as abstention;</p> <p>2. <u>E-voting</u>, the modalities of which are equivalent to the roll call.</p>	<p>Ballot papers are used to elect the Chamber's president and vice-presidents, as well as chairs of committees . Other cases of secret voting are specified by law or determined by the Chamber.</p>	<p>–</p>	<p>When vote by raising hands is held, the result is recorded by scrutineers appointed by the Secretary General.</p> <p>The chair or another person specified by law announces the result of a vote.¹⁵ If the result of any open vote on a procedural petition is obvious, it is not necessary to count the votes, unless a Deputy requests that the result is announced. Any Deputy may also object to results and proceedings during or immediately after the vote. If the Chamber agrees with the Deputy's objection, the vote must be retaken. If the Chamber's voting system is not used for that purpose, the chair asks the verifiers to count all votes and to determine the results.</p>

¹⁵ The result of every voting is announced as follows: the serial number of voting, the number of present Deputies, the amount of votes for the petition and against the petition and whether the petition has been passed or rejected.

Member State Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
Denmark Folketing	Not applicable.	Electronic voting is the usual way of voting in the Danish Parliament.	1. <u>Roll call viva voce</u> , 2. Vote by means of voting machine (<u>e-voting</u>), its results are nominally recorded.	–	Voting by counting the Members who have risen from their seats.	It is the duty of the Legal Service Office. If necessary, the Tellers lend their assistance, e.g. in cases where a voting machine cannot be used or when voting by roll call, they count the votes and inform the Speaker about the result.
Estonia Riigikogu	Applied in <u>committee</u> and political groups, albeit specific modality of voting is not prescribed in the Riigikogu Rules of Procedure and Internal Rules Act. <u>In plenary</u> only if the electronic voting system cannot be employed, in which case a vote by hands is nominally and numerically recorded, except	Generally applied for plenary voting.	Recording of electronic voting corresponds to a roll-call vote, except where carried out as a secret ballot.	Carried out: 1. <u>by ballot papers</u> (election of the President of the Republic and the President and Vice-Presidents of the Riigikogu); 2. <u>electronic voting</u> , the results are not nominally displayed	–	It is the duty of the responsible services of the Secretariat of the Riigikogu. If the voting procedure is violated in the plenary sitting, the chair shall suspend voting. A member of the Riigikogu may also indicate a failure by raising his/ her hand before voting is finished. In the case of voting by ballot papers, votes are counted publicly after the closing of voting. The National Electoral Committee or the voting committee prepares a record concerning the voting results. The chair of

	when a secret vote takes place (by ballot papers).			on the screen nor recorded in the stenos (appointment of other officials).		the sitting announces the voting results. Members of the Riigikogu may submit protests concerning the organisation of voting or the voting results to the National Electoral Committee or the voting committee.
Finland Eduskunta	Voting modality in committees and political groups as no electronic voting system is available in the rooms.	The normal type of voting in plenary. E-voting is also held regardless of whether a vote by standing up has already been taken, if the Speaker deems this necessary, if the vote by standing up has in the opinion of the Speaker not yielded a clear result or if a Representative so requests.	Voting is open and the results are always recorded by name and numerical result.	Applied in the case of elections/appointments.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The vote by standing up. 2. Open ballot if the voting apparatus is out of order, if the vote by using the voting apparatus has in the opinion of the Speaker not yielded a clear result or if there is a tie in a vote pertaining to the final decision of the Parliament. 	Control of vote results is the duty of the Central Office of the Parliament.

Member State Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
France Assemblée nationale	In votes by show of hands the position of individual Members is neither registered nor published in the Official Journal. The Chair announces the result ("the Assembly has (not) adopted") without giving the number of	1. <u>The ordinary open ballot</u> with Members voting from their seats, ¹⁶ 2. <u>the open ballot at the tribune or in the rooms adjoining the chamber</u> , with MPs voting by inserting a voting card in a bar code reader corresponding to their position to vote (for, against or abstentions). ¹⁷	The modalities of open ballots performed electronically are equivalent to roll call, except for public votes unexpectedly asked by the President, the Government, the Committee or the chair of a group, since their results are not recorded by name for	Applied in the case of candidate appointments.	Voting by sitting and standing carried out where the result of vote by raising of hands is not clear, which does not, however, give rise to a record of how individual Members have voted.	The Chair is responsible for the conduct of the vote. At his/ her request, he/ she may be assisted by an official (<i>le chef de plateau</i>) for the counting of votes in case of a vote by show of hands or by standing.

¹⁶ It is carried out on the Decision of the President or the Conference of Presidents, upon request of the Government or of the committee responsible, or a written request of a group chairperson or his delegate whose name has been notified beforehand to the President.

The votes of individual Members are immediately recorded by the computer, the overall result (number of voters, the required majority, votes for and against) is announced by the President of the meeting and posted on illuminated panels in the chamber. A detailed account of the vote, called "analysis" is also available. Presentation varies depending on the type of public scrutiny to which the National Assembly proceeds, albeit it is always possible to determine the position taken by the groups, individual Members voting differently than the groups' majority position as well as positions taken by non-attached Member's.

All analyses are displayed near the chamber, posted and published in the Official Journal, following the report of the session.

¹⁷ It is compulsory in two cases:

- where the Constitution requires a qualified majority;
- under Articles 49 and 50(1) of the Constitution, when voting on a declaration by the Government with or without liability.

The "analysis" (i.e. a detailed account of the vote) for this method of voting shows the position expressed by each Member and is presented both by group and by voting position, and indicates also the non-voters.

¹⁸ Under article 59 of the Rules of Procedure of the Senate, ordinary open ballot in the French Senate is taken *inter alia* in relation to financial legislation, organic laws, proposals for a revision of the Constitution.

<p>Sénat</p>	<p>voters. The modality of the vote is parallel to that carried out by the Assemblée nationale. This method is also used in committee voting.</p>	<p>Not applicable.</p>	<p>every individual MP. The ordinary open ballot and the ballot at the tribune. During the ordinary open ballot Senators deposit white (voting "for") blue ("against") and red ("abstention") paper ballots by the secretaries standing at the right, left and in the middle of the hemicycle, respectively.¹⁸</p>	<p>–</p>	<p>Voting by sitting and standing (for details see above at the Assemblée nationale). Should the voting by sitting and standing be insufficient to resolve doubts and/or disagreements, the Senate proceeds to ordinary open vote.</p>	<p>The vote is counted by the officials of the Senate under the control of secretaries (senators elected secretary of the Senate Bureau).</p>
--------------	--	------------------------	--	----------	---	---

Member State Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
<p>Germany Bundestag</p>	<p>"Simple" vote open to the public, albeit with no nominal record of how individual MPs have voted and no recorded numerical result. Only the decision in favour, against, or abstention is recorded.</p>	<p>Not applicable.</p>	<p>A vote by placing a voting card with "Yes," "No," or "Abstain" and the MP's name in an urn; both nominal and numerical results are recorded in the minutes and published. A roll call vote can be demanded by a parliamentary group or five per cent of the Members of the Bundestag. The Secretaries from the coalition and opposition count the roll call votes in a designated room.</p>	<p>MPs receive a ballot card and enter the polling station. They place their vote in an envelope, which they place in an urn upon leaving. This voting method is employed only under certain circumstances, i.e. the election of the President of the Bundestag, his/her deputy, and the Federal Chancellor.</p>	<p>Division vote – MPs leave the plenary hall and re-enter through three doors labelled "Yes," "No," and "Abstain," with no nominal record of how individuals MPs voted. Only the numerical results and the decision in favour, against, or abstention are recorded. The method employed only when the results of a simple vote are unclear and when it is doubtful a quorum will be reached.</p>	<p>The President and Vice President of the Bundestag as well as Secretaries from the coalition and opposition reside over the plenary sessions and oversee the voting. Parliamentary lawyers are also present during plenary sessions and advise the President of the Bundestag on any issues that may arise. The minutes of all plenary sessions, including the results of the votes, are made available online the following business day at the latest.</p>

<p>Bundesrat</p>	<p>The single voting of the Länder is not recorded, only the question of whether a decision has been taken by majority or not is recorded.</p>	<p>Not applicable.</p>	<p>The roll-call vote of the Länder is carried out at the request of one Land, with the Länder being called in an alphabetical order and their individual voting being recorded.</p>	<p>Not applicable.</p>	<p>–</p>	<p>The counting of the (positive) is done by the Bundesrat President, the Secretary General and the recording clerk, so there is a corresponding control.</p>
<p>Greece</p>	<p>The vote being open for the public, albeit there is no record of individual votes.</p>	<p>Not used although an e-voting system has been installed. It is ready-made, the identification mechanism to be applied is cards, albeit it also may ensure the necessary secrecy when a secret vote is in order.</p>	<p>Yes.</p>	<p>Effectuated by ballot.</p>	<p>An open vote by raising up.</p>	<p>The Speaker of the House is the one that declares a vote open and closed. The results of each voting should be announced in Parliament in plenary sitting by the Speaker of the House and hence be recorded in the Minutes.</p>

Member State Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
Hungary	Applied with the joint use of the vote counting machine. Voting is open and the results are always recorded by name and numerical result.	About 90 percent of the votes are carried electronically, the results of which are always recorded by name and numerically. Moreover, if there are any doubts as to the results of the voting by the show of hands, the voting is repeated with the use of the vote counting machine at the request of any Member.	1. <u>E-voting</u> the modalities of which are equivalent to the roll call; 2. <u>Voting by name</u> , held at the request of any faction in cases of open voting. ¹⁹ No voting by name is held regarding the number of committee members, the composition of committees and procedural motions.	Applied in which case the voting takes place on voting slips placed in envelopes, in a polling booth, with the use of a ballot-box. The notaries act as a committee on counting the votes.	–	The Secretary General's Office and the Department of Informatics are responsible for the control the voting results.

¹⁹ One faction may propose voting by name only once concerning the same motion for decision.

Member State Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
Ireland Dáil and Senate (lower and upper House, respectively)	–	Voting in plenary (both Houses) is generally held electronically.	<u>Plenary</u> : e-voting and voting by passing through the lobbies known as ' list ' or ' manual ' division . ²⁰ <u>Committees</u> : roll call is taken viva voce.	–	–	<u>Plenary sessions of both Chambers</u> : tellers are appointed for every division. <u>Committee</u> : during the votes the Clerk calls the names of MPs and records them on paper, then passes the result to the Chairperson to announce.

²⁰ A manual vote is required for (i) the election of the Speaker (both Houses), (ii) nomination of the Prime Minister and other Ministers, (iii) motion of confidence for the whole Government (Dáil). Manual or list votes can be taken at any time if the Speaker informs the House that: (i) electronic voting is not technically possible, (ii) the result may be unreliable, or (iii) s/he considers, for any other reason, that the vote should not be taken electronically.

Member State Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
Italy Chamber of Deputies	A usual modality of voting in committees. Voting by show of hands is open for the public but individual votes are not recorded.	Voting operations generally take place by means of electronic system with recording of names, except for votes regarding persons.	Normally <u>carried out electronically</u> , its result is nominally and numerically recorded in the verbatim reports and in the database available on the website. Votes of confidence or of no confidence are always carried out by actually <u>calling the roll</u> .	Secret ballot is carried out by electronic means.	–	The President establishes the order of voting, clarifies the meaning of votes and announces the results thereof (Rule 8 of the Rules of Procedure). The Deputy Secretaries co-operate with the President to ensure regularity of the voting procedure, they record individual votes when required and call the roll (Rule 11). When any irregularity occurs, the President may annul the vote and have it repeated immediately (Rule 57).
Senate	Construed as an open vote, albeit its result is not nominally recorded. Votes by show of hands may also be conducted	Applied: 1. to check the show of hands voting when the results are considered not clear; 2. for simultaneous	Fifteen Senators can request a roll-call vote. It may either be conducted by simultaneous roll-call voting or by calling the roll	Twenty Senators can request a secret ballot. ²¹ Votes relating to individuals	–	The President sets the voting schedule and proclaims the result of votes. He also oversees the functions attributed to Secretaries who call the roll and check the voting results. Secretaries generally assist the

²¹ The secret ballot is forbidden when Senate votes on finance bills or budgets and accounts, on piece of legislation concerning taxation and contributions, providing for budget allocation, entailing greater expenditure or reduced revenue.

	using the electronic voting system if the President deems it appropriate.	roll-call votes 3. for secret ballot in such a way so as to ensure the secrecy of the vote both when the vote is cast and when the results are recorded.	(the latter modality always in the case of the motions of (no) confidence).	and elections using ballot cards are always carried out by secret ballot.		President in ensuring the smooth transaction of business. In the event of voting irregularities, the President may order that the vote be repeated immediately, with or without the electronic voting system (Rule 118).
Latvia Saeima	It is an open vote used in committee. In plenary, the speaker may decide that the Saeima shall vote by show of hands only if the electronic system did not work. But in practice there have not been such a situation.	Electronic voting is the usual modality of casting a vote in plenary.	<u>Open ballot and electronic voting in plenary.</u> At least 10 Members may request that after the voting the vote of each Member be read out in the Plenary Chamber. As the results are public, any member can check the results published.	Only the President and judges of the Constitutional Court are elected by secret ballot (Constitution of the Republic of Latvia Article 36 and 85).	Voting by using ballot papers. Ballot papers are used for electing several officials.	As the results are public, any member can check the results published. According Rules of Procedure of the Saeima 142. If within one hour at least five Members question the validity (Article 54) of the results of a vote, the voting should be repeated.

Member State Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
<p>Lithuania Seimas</p>	<p>The mode of adopting decisions in committee. In plenary practically not used, albeit it may be applied upon decision by the presiding officer of the sitting e.g. in the case when electronic vote calculation system is not working.</p>	<p>The results of <u>e-votes in plenary</u> are always recorded by name, whereas <u>in committees</u>, as a rule, numerically. Under the parliamentary Rules of Procedure (Statute of the Seimas), e-voting is held on laws, resolutions, individual articles or assertions of draft law, session work programme, sitting agenda and various procedural issues.</p>	<p>1. <u>Electronic voting in plenary</u>; 2. <u>Roll call vote</u> on request by any of the parliamentary groups supported by at least one-third of the Seimas Members present at the sitting, when adopting laws, resolutions or other acts, except for individual appointments. Upon tallying the roll call votes, the presiding officer announces the name of each Seimas Member and his/her vote. However, the latter procedures of voting is quite rare.</p>	<p>Applied mostly in cases of appointments to and dismissals from positions when approval of the Seimas is required.</p>	<p>Open ballot voting in cases when it is necessary to elect several candidates to some posts from a larger number of candidates and when it has not been resolved to vote by secret ballot.</p>	<p>Services of the Office of the Seimas are responsible for the publishing of voting results.</p>

Member State Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
Luxembourg Chambre des Députés	Applied unless a nominal vote is required or requested by at least five MPs. The vote is open for the public but the individual votes are not nominally recorded.	Under the Rules of Procedure all types of votes, i.e. the nominal vote, the vote by hand and the secret ballot can be held by e-voting. In practice most of the votes take place electronically.	The nominal vote which is required in the case of the vote on the integral text of a bill. Moreover, any electronic vote the modalities of which are equivalent to the roll call.	Applied in the case of the elections or nominations and the presentation of candidates.	–	The votes of the public sittings are controlled by the Secretary-General.

Member State Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
Malta House of Representatives	–	–	The division into 'Ayes' and Noes' with names of Members recorded in the division report.	–	Vote by calling successively upon the Members who support and who challenge the Speaker's (plenary)/ Chair's (committee) decision to rise in their places.	The Speaker/ Chair declares to the House the result of the division and states the number of votes in favour and against. Should confusion or error occur regarding the numbers reported, The House proceeds to another division unless the correction may be otherwise made.

Member State Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
Netherlands	The result of show of hands vote is in the minutes of the debate.	Not applicable.	Held at the request of a Member or whenever in the opinion of a Member the proportions of votes by a show of hands are not clear, and as long as the result of a vote by a show of hands has not been adopted. Members cast their vote by uttering the word "Yea" ("voor") or "Nay" ("tegen").	Held by ballot papers placed in a box; always in the case of appointments, nominations or elections mentioned in the Constitution. ²²	A decision taken without a vote , on the proposal by the President if none of the members requests one. Members present in the plenary hall may, however, request that it be noted that they wish to be deemed to have voted against; in which case the decision is deemed to have been taken by the votes of the other members.	During voting one of the clerks checks the outcome of the votes immediately. There is also a link with the Reporting Office so they can check the recorded minutes if there is any doubt.

²² If it concerns appointments, nominations or elections not mentioned in the Constitution, the House may determine in a special case that other rules shall apply.

Member State Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
Poland Sejm	Held simultaneously with the use of the voting machine or, in the event that taking of a vote by means of voting machine is impossible, the Marshal of the Sejm may order the vote to be taken by show of hands and the counting of votes cast to be done by secretaries.	The results of the electronic vote are always nominally and numerically recorded.	1. <u>E-voting</u> 2. <u>Voting by use of voting cards with the Deputy's first and last name signed thereon and a ballot box.</u> ²³ Deputies named by a Secretary of the Sejm drop their voting cards in an alphabetical order into the ballot-box. The Marshal of the Sejm designates five secretaries to open the ballot-box and to count the votes cast.	–	–	Under Article 188(5) of the Standing Orders of the Sejm, the Marshal of the Sejm announces the results of a vote. In the case of a vote by roll call, the Marshal announces the results on the basis of minutes presented by the secretaries of the Sejm designated to count votes.
Senate	The modalities of the vote are parallel to that in	Electronic voting system registers the individual	1. Open vote using electronic device consisting	Held in personal matters ²⁴	–	Under Article 53(8) of the Rules and Regulations of the Senate, the voting

²³ Held if the majority of the Sejm so decides, on a motion of the Marshal of the Sejm or a written motion supported by at least 30 Deputies. In the case of the Senate, roll-call using voting cards is held on the motion of the Marshal of the Senate or of at least 20 Senators.

²⁴ Except in the case of votes on the composition of Senate committees and on the recall of the chairman of a committee in the case of his/ her written resignation from the office proffered to the Marshal of the Senate.

	<p>the lower chamber (Sejm, see above)</p>	<p>votes of Senators.</p>	<p>of pressing a button on the apparatus and raising an arm. 2. <u>Roll-call by use of voting cards</u> with the Senator's first and last name signed thereon (see above).</p>	<p>using sealed voting cards and a ballot box.</p>		<p>results are announced by the Marshal of the Senate. The results of a roll-call vote and of a secret vote are announced by the Marshal of the Senate on the basis of a report presented by the secretaries of the Senate charged with counting the vote.</p>
--	--	---------------------------	---	--	--	--

Member State Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
Portugal Assembly	Not applicable.	Electronic voting is used in the following situations: 1. <u>when voting by roll call is required</u> ; 2. <u>in votes by standing and sitting</u> where the Constitution requires a qualified majority ²⁵ , votes are also made using electronic voting (Article 94(4) of the Rules of Procedure).	Members are called to vote in alphabetical order and their votes are also recorded electronically. Roll call is held on specific matters ²⁶ at the request of one tenth of all Members of the Assembly and any other matter if the Assembly or the Conference of Leaders so decides.	Yes.	Voting by standing and sitting , which is the usual form of voting. Only the parliamentary group's sense of vote is recorded and the Bureau calculate the results according to each parliamentary group's share of the seats in the Assembly. If some Members vote differently from their parliamentary group line, the Bureau specify both the number of individual votes and their influence on the overall result, if	The result of voting is recorded by the Bureau of the Assembly of the Republic, chaired by the President of the Assembly. The Secretaries of the Bureau are tasked to, particularly, "record votes" (Article 28(1) of the Rules of Procedure) and "the Bureau shall immediately announce the result of each vote, and shall expressly state whether the applicable requisites laid down in the Constitution and these Rules of Procedure have been fulfilled" (Article 92(3) of the Rules of Procedure). The services of the Assembly (i.e. Plenary Support Division), provide administrative and

²⁵ This qualified majority is required e.g. to reject the Government's Programme, to pass a motion of no confidence in the Government, to confirm decrees or resolutions that were vetoed by the President of the Republic, to pass organisational laws or amend the Constitution.

²⁶ These matters concern the following: (i) authorisation to declare war or make peace; (ii) authorisation and confirmation of a declaration of a state of siege or a state of emergency; (iii) charges against the President of the Republic; (iv) the grant of amnesties and general pardons; (v) reconsideration of decrees or resolutions that have been the object of a presidential veto.

					any. These individual votes are also recorded and published.	secretarial support to the Bureau, as well as specialised technical support (Resolution of the Assembly no. 20/2004, of 16 Feb. 2004, Article 8).
--	--	--	--	--	--	---

Member State Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
Romania	An open vote which is as a rule applied in committees. In plenary if approved by the Chamber, following a proposal made by the Chairman of the sitting or by a parliamentary group leader.	The open vote is cast, as a rule, by electronic means.	An open vote procedure held when approved by the Chamber, following a proposal made by the Chairman of the sitting or by a parliamentary group leader.	Cast by means of ballot papers ²⁷ , balls or by electronic system where the Rules of Procedure so provide, or if the Chamber so decides following a proposal by the Chair/ a parliamentary group leader.	–	If a parliamentary group leader challenges the correctness of an open vote result and if the plenum approves the resumption of the vote, the voting procedure is that approved by the Chamber. In an e-vote, if the Chairman, assisted by two secretaries, notices malfunctions in the circuit connection ²⁸ , he/she asks the plenum to repeat the ballot using a different voting procedure. In case of a secret vote cast by ballot papers or balls, a Committee ²⁹ for counting and validating votes is established.

²⁷ Votes for appointments are cast by using ballots-papers, unless the law/Rules of procedure stipulates a different voting procedure.

²⁸ A group leader may also notify the Chairman of such malfunctions.

²⁹ The Committee is made up of one representative of each parliamentary group and assisted by two Secretaries of the sitting.

Member State Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
<p>Slovakia</p> <p>National Council</p>	<p>Show of hands is held as an open vote.</p>	<p>E-voting it is the usual way of voting, the results of which are nominally and numerically recorded.</p>	<p>The modalities of e-voting are equivalent to the roll call.</p>	<p>–</p>	<p>1. Voting ballot</p> <p>2. Other method of public voting decided by the National Council.</p>	<p>The tellers of the National Council (in their absence - Members designated by the National Council) supervise the correctness of voting and election procedures.³⁰ Upon a motion of the Chair, the National Council may decide without debate to have the votes counted by tellers if there are any doubts concerning the results of a vote.</p>

³⁰ The tellers are also responsible for the correct and complete Minutes of the Sessions and sign resolutions and other documents approved by the National Council.

Member State Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
Slovenia National Assembly	Voting by show of hands is carried out when the electronic voting system is not working or if there is no such system in the room where the session is being held.	E-voting is always ³¹ used during: 1. <u>sessions of the National Assembly</u> - the result of a vote is recorded by name and by number; 2. <u>meetings of working bodies</u> - the result is recorded by number.	Electronic voting during the sessions of the National Assembly the modalities of which are equivalent to the roll call.	In cases of elections, appointments and dismissals, and where so provided by the Constitution, law, or Rules of Procedure of the National Assembly.	–	The chairperson establishes and announces the result of the vote after each vote has been carried out (Rules of Procedure, Article 90).

³¹ Except for reasons stated in Rules of Procedure, Article 87, paragraph 2.

Member State Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
<p>Spain Congress of Deputies</p>	<p>Show of hands is applied in parliamentary groups.</p>	<p>E-voting may take place in two types of voting: 1. <u>ordinary voting</u> – each member’s vote and the total result of the voting are recorded; 2. <u>secret voting</u> – the total result of the voting is recorded, but omitting the identity of voters.</p>	<p>Ordinary voting by: 1. <u>electronic system</u>; 2. <u>public roll-call</u> by those in favour <u>standing up</u> first, those against next and lastly those who abstain.</p>	<p>Secret ballot may be carried out by: 1. an electronic process, 2. 2. ballot (papers);</p>	<p>1. Voting by assent to the Speaker’s proposal; 2. Under article 82(2) of the <u>Standing Orders of the Congress of Deputies</u>, the Bureau of the Chamber may authorize in motivated writing that Deputies give their vote by electronic procedure with personal check.³²</p>	<p>The result of the voting process is controlled by the Speaker. In case of vacancy, absence or illness, the President is replaced by the Vice President who exercises the functions assigned by the President or the Bureau of the Chamber. The Secretaries assist the President in meetings to ensure order in the discussion and correctness of the voting process. In fact, clerks attending to the Plenary or the committees ensure the control of voting.</p>

³² This modality of vote may only be applied: (i) in the plenary sessions in those voting’s time which are not susceptible to fragmentation or modification, but it is foreseeable how and when they are going to be carried out; (ii) in cases of pregnancy, maternity, paternity or serious illness which prevent the performance of parliamentary tasks and in attention to special circumstances considered sufficiently justified.

Member State Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
Sweden Riksdag	Not applicable.	It is held if the Speaker finds that the outcome of a vote taken by having the Members rise still leaves room for doubt, or if a Member calls for a count. MPs push one of the three buttons <i>Yes</i> , <i>No</i> or <i>Abstain</i> mounted in their desks, the outcome is shown on large display boards. The way each Member votes is registered.	<p><u>1. E-voting</u> the modalities of which are equivalent to the roll call.</p> <p><u>2. A call of names:</u> when the e-voting system cannot be used. The Deputy Speakers are called up first, followed by other MPs according to constituency. Responses must be one of the following: <i>Yes</i>, <i>No</i>, or <i>Abstain</i>.</p>	–	<p>1. Vote by acclamation: the Speaker puts to the question every motion put forward in the course of the deliberations. The question must be worded in such a way that it can be answered with a 'Yes' or 'No'. The Speaker declares what he presumes to be the result, and confirms the decision by striking his gavel, unless an MP calls for a vote;</p> <p>2. Open ballot by having the MPs rise in their places (first those in favor, then those against) concerning matters on which the parties disagree.</p>	The Speaker announces the result of the vote and confirms the decision by striking his gavel. In the vote by a call of names, the Speaker calls upon two Members to join him at the Speaker's table and record the vote.

Member State Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
United Kingdom House of Commons	Not applicable.	Not applicable.	'Division' votes , the results are recorded by name. MPs divide into two groups: those in favour (the Ayes) and against (the Noes), by proceeding through "lobbies" (i.e. one of two corridors located on either side of the Chamber) where they are counted. There is no formal way to abstain.	–	'Deferred divisions' : Since 2000, at present take place on Wednesdays. Voted by ballot paper; allowed for certain types of business (motions on statutory instruments (secondary legislation) and on certain types of motion which are not subject to amendment). ³³	Names of MPs voting are recorded by Clerks. For each division there are four "tellers", two from each side of the House. They record the number of MPs voting each way in a division by counting them as they exit the division lobby. Once the division (voting) is over the tellers announce the results to the House.
House of Lords	Not applicable.	Not applicable.	"Division" votes , Members proceed through one of two corridors; one for	–	–	One Teller from each side and two Clerks go to each lobby to record the numbers and names of those voting. Votes cast by

³³ In practice few if any divisions are voted on in this way. In the 2010-12 Session there were 21 deferred divisions of a total of 506 votes of all kinds (between May 2010 and May 2012).

			"content", and the other for "not content". Members with a disability may vote from within the Chamber.			disabled Members from within the Chamber are counted by a clerk or the Lord on the Woolsack or in the Chair.
--	--	--	--	--	--	--

5.3. Voting methods in selected parliaments of non-EU states

Non-EU state Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
Andorra Consell General	Facilitated by electronic voting with the record of numerical result.	Used as a technical means to facilitate voting by show of hands; the numerical result is recorded. E- voting is used in plenary except indicated cases of oral voting or secret ballot.	Oral voting which is the method used in committees and in plenary in the case of the appointment of the Head of Government.	Applied in the case of the appointment of the Parliament board.	–	Control of voting results is the duty of the responsible services of the General Secretariat of the Parliament, under the supervision of the political authorities (secretaries of the Parliament board).

Non-EU state Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
<p>Bosnia and Herzegovina</p> <p>House of Peoples and House of Representatives</p>	<p>Applied upon the request by one third of the delegates/representatives (House of Peoples and House of Representatives respectively).</p>	<p>Generally, voting in the Parliamentary Assembly is carried out electronically, except where the e-voting system is not functioning or upon request by one third of the delegates/representatives (House of Peoples/Representatives respectively), voting takes place by raising voting cards or by raising hands.</p>	<p>Applied when the Speaker (also Deputy Speaker in the House of Representatives) considers it necessary or at a proposal of any delegate/representative (House of Peoples/Representatives respectively), in order to remove any doubt in the regularity of the voting results. Moreover, e-voting the modalities of which are equivalent to the roll call.</p>	<p>–</p>	<p>Voting by raising the voting card, upon request by one third of the delegates/representatives (House of Peoples and House of Representatives respectively).</p>	<p>Control of voting results is done by the Secretary of the House of Peoples/Representatives and the Office of the Secretary of the House of Peoples/representatives.</p>

Non-EU state Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
<p>Canada</p> <p>House of Commons (Lower Chamber)</p>	<p>Applied exclusively in committee meetings</p>	<p>Not applicable.</p>	<p>In cases where the division is not clear (see other methods of voting), a Member may insist on a <u>recorded division</u>. In this case, each member must rise and their vote is recorded.</p>	<p>–</p>	<p>1. A vote carried without dissent, when Members remain silent; 2. A vote “on division” - when some members have voiced their dissent; 3. A voice vote, in which case members say “yea” or “nay”; In all of the above mentioned methods, votes of individual MPs are not recorded.</p>	<p>The Clerk of the House of Commons, under the authority of the Speaker, is responsible for keeping the record of decisions made in the chamber.</p>
<p>Iceland</p> <p>Althingi</p>	<p>It is an open vote and the results are always nominally and numerically recorded.</p>	<p>E-voting it is the general method. Voting results are issued in terms of numerical results and names.</p>	<p>Roll call viva voce. Moreover, also the modalities of a vote by show of hands and e-voting are equivalent to roll-call.</p>	<p>–</p>	<p>–</p>	<p>There are two staff members of the Parliament’s Secretariat present at every voting in plenum and they control the voting results.</p>

Non-EU state Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
<p>Israel Knesset</p>	<p>Applied <u>in committees</u>. <u>In plenary</u>, the Chair may decide that a vote held as part of a series of votes is taken by the show of hands, unless a Parliamentary Group voices objection. The votes need not be counted (unless a certain majority is required) if the Chair sees that the motion put to vote was supported/ rejected by a majority. The Chair may announce before any vote that the votes shall be counted.</p>	<p>E-voting is a standard method of voting.</p>	<p>Held <u>in plenary</u> on demand expressed in writing by at least twenty Knesset Members, or on demand by the Government. <u>In committee</u>, the Chairman may, at his initiative or on request by a Member, to hold a roll-call vote, and note in the minutes how each MP voted. Also the electronic vote is a roll-call vote within the meaning applied in this note, as its results are nominally and numerically recorded.</p>	<p>Held on specific matters such as the election of the President of the state or the election of the State Audit.</p>	<p>—</p>	<p>The Chairman of the sitting announces the results at the end of the vote. A Member of the Knesset who has participated in an electronic vote, and claimed that his vote was not recorded, or he has requested that his vote be changed due to a mistake, shall announce the fact immediately after the voting. The Chairman of the sitting shall consider the request, and shall immediately announce the request and his decision whether to change the results of the vote. While the Chairman of the sitting announces and calls an end to a vote, the control of the implementation of the voting procedures is the duty of the Secretary General and his Deputies.</p>

Non-EU state Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
Macedonia	An open vote applied in plenary and always in committee, the results are recorded numerically.	The usual modality of voting, with the results being nominally and numerically recorded.	Held in plenary in order to determine precisely the voting result. ³⁴ Moreover, the modalities of e-voting are equivalent to the roll call.	Usually used for election and discharge of public officials (for example for President of the Assembly).	–	During the plenary session, each MP can check the accuracy of the vote at the so-called “ <i>geographical screen</i> ”.
Montenegro	An open vote applied in committee, in plenary only if the electronic voting system is not operational.	The usual method of voting in plenary. The numerical result of voting is announced at the session, but the electronic system records the individual votes of MPs.	Roll call is applied if determined by the President of the Parliament or requested by 10 MPs. Moreover, the modalities of e-voting are equivalent to the roll call.	Secret ballot is taken by ballot papers.	–	The President of the Parliament establishes the vote results and announce if the motion has been adopted or not. The President (Vice-President) is assisted by the Secretary General in applying the Rules of Procedure (in cases of a secret ballot referred to as the Voting Commission). In committee, the chair, with the help of the committee secretary, counts the votes and announces the results.

³⁴ Roll call is held on request by the President or a Member of the Assembly whose request is supported by at least ten MPs, and only if the proposal put to vote has received five votes more/ less than the number of votes necessary for its adoption.

Non-EU state Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
Switzerland Nationalrat	Not applicable.	E-voting is a usual method of voting, its results are shown on the screen and published in the form of a list of names. ³⁵	1. <u>E-voting</u> the modalities of which are equivalent to the roll call. When it cannot be applied: 2. <u>Voting by calling over MPs' names in an alphabetical order</u> who respond from their seats 'Yes', 'No' or 'Abstention'.	–	Voting by standing up , only in the case of in camera debates or when the electronic voting system cannot be applied.	–
Ständerat	The vote is open and constitutes the usual modality of voting.	Not applicable.	Voting by calling over names (see point 2 above) on request by ten Members.	–	–	Counting of votes is not made when the result of a vote is obvious, except for global and final votes, as well as votes where the consent of the majority of Council members is required under Article 159 § 3 of the Federal Constitution.

³⁵ he said list of names provides the information whether an individual Member voted for, against, abstained from voting, did not participate in the vote, or is excused (e.g. on the basis of a permanent delegation, maternity, accident or illness).

Non-EU state Chamber	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
<p>Turkey</p> <p>Grand National Assembly</p>	<p>Deputies stand up if there is any doubt as to the result; or are counted in two groups as those voted in favor and against if five Deputies stand up and propose to do so. Vote by show of hands is conducted as a rule in all cases where open or secret vote is not required. It is also the mode for deciding which modality of open voting should be applied.</p>	<p>Deputies vote by pushing buttons on their desks. E-vote is conducted in two cases:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. an open electronic vote, recorded and annexed to the minutes of the sitting so that everyone may learn how a Deputy voted; 2. during vote by show of hands if there are doubts about the result of the voting between the Speaker and the Secretaries or if five Deputies request voting by division. 	<p>An open vote³⁶ conducted according to three modalities:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. by placing into a box the ballot papers on which the names, surnames and electoral districts of Deputies are indicated; 2. by Deputies replying loudly "yes", "no" or "abstention" when standing up after their names are read out, and recording the votes cast by the secretaries; 3. an open e-vote, recorded and annexed to the minutes of the sitting. 	<p>Yes, it is conducted by placing circular ballot papers containing no marks into a box located on the floor. White circular ballot paper means yes, green means abstention and red means no.</p>	<p>—</p>	<p>The Speaker or Vice-Speakers of the Grand National Assembly of Turkey as presiding officers, as well as Secretaries reside over the plenary sessions and oversee the voting.</p>

³⁶ In practice, to save time, open votes are conducted by e-voting. Where voting by show of hands or secret vote is not obligatory, conducting an open vote is subject to the written request of at least fifteen deputies.

5.4. The Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe

	Show of hands	Electronic vote	Roll-call vote	Secret ballot	Other methods of voting	Control of voting results
Parliamentary Assembly	The President may decide that the Assembly shall vote by show of hands, but this would only happen if the electronic system did not function.	All votes take place electronically, except in the case of a malfunctioning of the electronic voting system and concerning appointments. The numerical result are displayed publicly in the Chamber and recorded in the reports of the debates. Members' individual votes are also made public and appear on the Assembly website.	It proceeds in the alphabetical order of the representatives' names who respond by <i>Yes</i> , <i>No</i> or <i>Abstention</i> . The votes are recorded in the reports of the debates in the alphabetical order of the representatives' names. Roll call is only allowed for the vote on the whole of a draft text (Rule 39(7) of the Rules of Procedure) or if the electronic system cannot be used for technical reasons. ³⁷	Applied in the case of appointments.	Vote by standing up ; the President may decide that the Assembly shall vote in this manner, but this would only happen if the electronic system did not function.	Given that the vote is expressed electronically, there is no need to control the results. And as the results are public, any member can also check the results published.

³⁷ However, only if at least one sixth of the representatives authorised to vote, belonging to at least five national delegations, request it.

6. TRANSPARENCY AND DEMOCRATIC RESPONSIBILITY

6.1. State of the art in the European Parliament

The European Parliament		2. Is it possible for the electorate to check what MPs declared and how they voted?
Plenary	Since final votes of legislative procedures are roll call votes, there is a high transparency of the political positions taken by Parliament. Important amendments are also regularly put to roll call voting.	In the case of roll call votes, a nominal record of votes is available on the Internet the day after the vote. There is also a large number of academic studies evaluating the voting behaviour of individual MEPs and political groups. An ever increasing offer of video streamed meetings and debates, both at committee and plenary level, improves access by citizens to Parliament's work. They enable observation of MEP's declarations and could even, depending on the material recorded, make the votes of individual MEPs transparent in cases of a vote by show of hands. Visitor groups remain an important tool for the electorate to observe the accessible part of the EP's activities.
Committees	European Parliament committee meetings are, almost without exception, open to the public. Meetings of committees' group coordinators are, however, held in private. Exceptionally, committees can decide to declare a meeting (or part of a meeting) to be held in private.	
Political groups	Meetings are generally held in private.	

6.2. Transparency measures in the national parliaments of the EU Member States

Member State Chamber		2. Is it possible for the electorate to check what MPs declared and how they voted?
Austria	Plenary: A summary of plenary proceedings (including summaries of MPs contributions) is provided by the parliamentary press service. Committee: most committees are not open to the public. If proceedings are not confidential (which is the case only a few committees and sub-committees), the parliamentary press service provides a summary of the proceedings including the statements of every MP present.	With regard to plenary proceedings, every speech and declaration of MPs is in the stenographic record; voting only in case of roll-call votes. In committees, individual voting is usually not recorded.
Belgium House of Representatives Senate	In final votes on legislation nominal votes are compulsory (constitutional prescript). The same rules as in the House of Representatives apply.	In the case of nominal voting, votes and abstentions cast by Members are published in the <i>Verbatim Report</i> . It is not the case when votes are cast by sitting and standing. Members' statements are in both cases published in the <i>Verbatim report</i> . The same rules as in the House of Representatives apply.

Member State Chamber		2. Is it possible for the electorate to check what MPs declared and how they voted?
Croatia ³⁸	Article 84 of the Constitution of the Republic of Croatia stipulates that sessions of the Croatian Parliament shall be public. The course of the debate and voting may be followed through the direct transmission (radio and television channels), or through the video-stream on the web site of the Croatian Parliament (http://itv.sabor.hr/video/). The official bulletin of Parliament, <i>Izvjescja Hrvatskoga sabora</i> , shall publish inter alia: overviews of the basic matters subject to discussion and debate at sessions of Parliament, individual bills or final drafts of bills and other acts of Parliament, individual texts of enacted laws and other legislation and regulations, acts of the President of the Republic, conclusions of Parliament and parliamentary working bodies, overviews of the work of the Government.	The official bulletin of Parliament contains inter alia: initiatives, positions and opinions expressed with reference to matters subject to debate and decision-making in Parliament, brief speeches delivered at sessions of Parliament, deputy questions and replies of the Government. The Information and Documentation Department of the Croatian Parliament keeps records of all individual debates of MPs, debates of MPs on behalf of deputy clubs, corrections of inaccurate statements, replies and answers to replies. E-Doc database called Statistical indicators: http://infodok.sabor.hr/StatistikaFrm.aspx?vrsta=ZastAkt provides an overview of the MPs' activities on plenary sessions of the Parliament.
Cyprus House of Representatives	Plenary sessions are open to the public.	Plenary sessions are open to the public. Voting by show of hands is open but no MPs names are recorded.

³⁸ See supra note 12.

Member State Chamber		2. Is it possible for the electorate to check what MPs declared and how they voted?
<p>Czech Republic Chamber of Deputies</p>	<p>By web site of the Chamber of Deputies. There is a special database on legislative process (available only in Czech language) in which it is possible to find all information relating to legislative process: http://www.psp.cz/sqw/sntisk.sqw</p> <p>It should be noted that all acts of law must be voted on only in an open form.</p>	<p>The Chamber's voting system provides a configuration showing how the individual Deputies voted. The configuration shall be made available to the public and to the media upon request. This provision does not apply to meetings or their parts closed to the public.</p> <p>Moreover, MPs have their own website where their personal voting history and stenographic records of their speeches are available.</p>
<p>Denmark Folketing</p>	<p><u>Plenary</u>: In the Danish Parliament there is a high degree of transparency as regards voting results, which are made available to the public on the Folketing Websites. Votes about amendments are made public in the same manner.</p> <p><u>Committees</u>: Ordinary committee meetings are held behind closed doors, unless the committee in question decides otherwise. In practice the committees hold many hearings which are open to the public. The reports of the committees are published on the Folketing Websites.</p> <p><u>Political groups</u>: Meetings are generally held in private.</p>	<p>In the Plenary votes are usually taken by means of a voting machine which indicates the names of Members who vote for or against the Bill, Members who abstain from voting as well as those who are absent.</p>

Member State Chamber		2. Is it possible for the electorate to check what MPs declared and how they voted?
<p>Estonia Riigikogu</p>	<p>Plenary: The Constitution of the Republic of Estonia (§ 72) stipulates that voting in the Riigikogu shall be open. Voting by secret ballot is held in the cases prescribed by the Constitution or by the Riigikogu Procedure Act, only in the election or appointment of officials.</p> <p>Committee meetings are usually not open to the public. Minutes of committee sittings are public and shall set out: the time and the place of the sitting; the persons participating in the sitting; the agenda for the sitting; the resolutions adopted and the voting results (presented in general but not as a roll call votes). Synopsis of the meeting may be presented as press release.</p> <p>Political groups: meetings are held in private.</p>	<p>As final votes of legislative procedures are roll call votes there is a high transparency of the political positions taken by Parliament. Voting results are presented at the homepage of the Parliament: http://www.riigikogu.ee/index.php?id=171751.</p>

Member State Chamber		2. Is it possible for the electorate to check what MPs declared and how they voted?
Greece	<u>Plenary</u> : Plenary sessions are open to the public. <u>Committees</u> : Parliament committee meetings preparing a draft law are open to the public.	<u>Plenary</u> : All votes are recorded in a report, in the Minutes and in the video file. <u>Committees</u> : All votes are recorded in the Minutes.
Hungary National Assembly	The data in connection with the debates and votes find on the web site of the Hungarian Parliament. http://www.parlament.hu/ The plenary sessions are partly broadcast by the state Television channels and continually (the whole session online) from the web site of the Hungarian Parliament. The videos, the text of the debates (verbatim minutes) and also the voting results are part of an integrated electronic parliamentary system (PAIR), which is accessible and also searchable. Thus all the mentioned information and data is accessible and open to the public from the webpage.	Yes.
Ireland Dáil and Senate (lower and upper House, respectively)	The results of the divisions are published electronically in the debate record on the Oireachtas website. This is generally within a few days of the debate (earlier for the plenary sessions, later for the Committees). Formal print publication of the divisions is done on an annual basis as part of the Journal of Proceedings.	

Member State Chamber		2. Is it possible for the electorate to check what MPs declared and how they voted?
<p>Italy</p> <p>Chamber of Deputies</p> <p>Senate</p>	<p>Under Article 64 of the Italian Constitution, the sittings of the Parliament (both Chambers) are public. It is possible to attend live debates from public galleries above the plenary hall.</p> <p>The sittings of the House, and sometimes of the Committees, are transmitted live on the internet, on radio and on the Chamber of Deputies satellite television channel. Particularly important debates are broadcast on public television. Verbatim reports of debates are always available from the Chamber of Deputies website on the same day as they are held, and in printed version on the day after. Verbatim reports of the sittings of Committees are also published, both in printed publications and on the internet.</p> <p>The videos of sittings of the House and, sometimes, of Committees are available on internet site. The satellite Senate TV transmits the sittings and important debates are also broadcast on public TV. A summary report and a verbatim report of every public sitting of the Plenary is compiled and published. Such reports are also available at internet site of the Senate together with the "final statements of sitting" ("comunicati di fine seduta") which give a very brief résumé of the sittings. A</p>	<p>On the Chamber of Deputies website a database of all the electronic votes carried out in the House is available. It is possible to check votes by month, by single sitting, by bill, by parliamentary group and by single Deputy.</p> <p>On internet site public can see the result of every vote of a sitting, the total results and the vote expressed by each Senator.</p>

	<p>summary report is also published and available on internet site for Committee's sittings. A verbatim report of Committee is also provided in certain cases established by the Rules of Procedure.</p>	
--	--	--

Member State Chamber		2. Is it possible for the electorate to check what MPs declared and how they voted?
<p>Latvia Saeima</p>	<p>Sittings of the Saeima are public, and so are the results of vote. The electorate can on-line in internet watch the proceeding of the Saeima. The agenda, attached documents, voting results are available on the website of the Saeima.</p>	<p>Under Rule 147 of the Rules of Procedure of the Saeima, transcripts of open sittings and the attached written answers to questions, as well as statements of Members explaining the reasons for their voting, shall be published in the newspaper <i>Latvijas Vēstnesis</i>. The following shall be attached to a transcript: 1) the minutes of a Saeima sitting (prepared by the Records Department and signed by the person chairing the sitting – the Speaker or a Deputy Speaker and the Saeima Secretary or his/her Deputy) which contain the agenda considered during the sitting, the decisions adopted, and the results of the voting; 2) the table of contents of the transcript; 3) the data fixed by the electronic voting system; 4) written answers to questions posed by Saeima Members; 5) the statements of the Members explaining the reasons for their voting that have not been read out at the Saeima sitting.</p>
<p>Lithuania Seimas</p>	<p>The results of votes at the plenary are shortly published on the official website of the parliament. Verbatim records of Seimas sittings are published on internet as well. Also plenary sittings of the Seimas are broadcasted online.</p>	<p>In the case of voting at the plenary records of the results of votes are public and easily accessible.</p>

Member State Chamber		2. Is it possible for the electorate to check what MPs declared and how they voted?
<p>Luxembourg Chambre des Députés</p>	<p>Plenary: sessions are open to the public and broadcast on the TV channel of the Chambre des Députés and its homepage (live videostreaming). All the videos of the plenary sessions are archived on the internet and can be consulted at any time. Debates and votes are also published in the verbatim record of the plenary sittings.</p> <p>Committees: meetings of the standing committees are usually not open to the public but the minutes of the meetings are published and can be found on the homepage of the Parliament.</p>	<p>The website of the Chambre des Députés gives access for every MP to his recent work (i.e. parliamentary questions, interpellations, bills, videos of his speeches during plenary sessions, ...). In case of nominal votes, the vote of every MP will be published in the verbatim record, which features also the declarations made by MPs during the public sittings.</p> <p>Votes taking place in the committees are usually not nominally recorded and the personal vote of a MP is only published in the minutes if he asks for it expressly.</p>
<p>Malta House of Representatives</p>	<p>All debates and discussions in the House shall be taken down by appointed officers to this effect and when signed by the Speaker and the Clerk, shall be printed and constitute the journals of the House. Exceptions concern debates held in camera, where the proceedings are either not put down or not reproduced in the journals of the House. Under Standing Orders of the House of Representatives, sittings (if not held in camera) shall be broadcast live in their entirety on the radio by Public Broadcasting services.</p>	<p>Votes are taken openly and entered into the minutes of the proceedings.</p>
<p>Netherlands</p>	<p>Plenary Debates are open to the public and even some of the committee meetings are open. The minutes, including the voting's, are available to the public on the website the morning after the debate.</p>	<p>What MPs declared is always in the minutes which are available to the public.</p>

Member State Chamber		2. Is it possible for the electorate to check what MPs declared and how they voted?
<p>Poland</p> <p>Sejm</p> <p>Senate</p>	<p>Sittings of the Sejm are recorded and broadcast live on television and on the Internet (www.sejm.gov.pl). Minutes and a shorthand report (the official record of the proceedings) is drawn up from a sitting of the Sejm. The minutes of a sitting contain a short record of proceedings of the debate and (in the appendices) complete texts of bills passed, resolutions adopted, reports and motions submitted, as well as other materials considered by the Sejm. A shorthand report contains a complete, stylistically edited record of proceedings in the debate and the appendices, including the texts of interpellations and Deputies' questions and answers to them, specifications of bills and draft resolutions introduced in the debate, specification of results of votes by roll call.</p> <p>Plenary: Sittings are recorded and broadcast live on television and on the Internet: www.senat.gov.pl. Committees: Sittings – except those held in camera – have been video streamed since 2 April 2012.</p> <p>Political groups: meetings are generally held in private.</p> <p>Minutes and a stenographic record are drafted of the course of the Senate sitting.</p>	<p>The results of voting are published at: www.sejm.gov.pl. The above mentioned site also contains information about MP's attendance/absence during the voting.</p> <p>In case of deciding during a closed sitting of the Sejm (or the Senate) – results of all votes are not published and the sitting is not broadcast, so individual decisions of MPs are not revealed to the public. Still a complete secrecy is not guaranteed, since votes are performed according to general rules (by show of hands or roll cast), so all Deputies may – at least theoretically – find out how their colleagues voted.</p> <p>There is a high transparency of the political positions taken by senators as votes on legislative acts are nominally recorded by the electronic equipment. The results are available on the Senate website the day after the vote. A number of NGO's monitor and analyse the voting behaviour of individual politicians and political groups.</p>

Member State Chamber		2. Is it possible for the electorate to check what MPs declared and how they voted?
<p>Portugal Assembly</p>	<p>Pursuant to Article 110 of the Rules of Procedure, plenary sittings and parliamentary committee meetings are public. All plenary sittings are broadcast live by the Parliament Channel, which makes available the video signal for broadcasting through public and private cable television channels to all licensed broadcasters (Resolution of the Assembly of the Republic no. 37/2007, of 20 August 2007).</p> <p>Plenary sittings are transcribed and published in the Official Journal of the Assembly of the Republic. Parliamentary committee meetings can also be broadcast unless the matters under consideration are of classified nature (Article 110 of the Rules of Procedure).</p> <p>In addition, the Assembly of the Republic has and is responsible for maintaining a website, which makes available, as much as possible, on a real-time basis, information regarding all legislative and parliamentary activities.</p>	<p>Yes. Through the website, any citizen may watch the Parliament Channel, search the Official Journal of the Assembly of the Republic (the 1st series is the transcription of the plenary sittings), access a database in which the preparatory work in relation to each legislative initiative is available for consultation, as well as the results of the corresponding votes, or MPs speeches that can even be displayed on the screen.</p> <p>As regards the parliamentary committee proceedings, in addition to the information that can be searched in the database, the committee minutes and the reports on the discussion and vote on the details are made available on the respective committee websites.</p> <p>The website of the Parliament also includes an area for each Member webpage or weblog, which facilitates interaction with citizens.</p>

Member State Chamber		2. Is it possible for the electorate to check what MPs declared and how they voted?
<p>Romania Chamber of Deputies</p>	<p>Plenary: Sittings are public and broadcast on-line, unless, at the request of the President/parliamentary group, the Chamber decides, with the majority vote of the present MPs, that certain sittings are secret. The public sittings of the Chamber of Deputies may be attended by diplomats, representatives of the press, radio and television channels, other guests and general public.</p> <p>Committees: Meetings are open, unless otherwise ruled in their plenum, and may be broadcast on the internal TV network of the Chamber of Deputies and on the radio and television stations.</p> <p>Parliamentary groups: Meetings are generally held in private.</p>	<p>Yes, by means of: media, NGOs, civic associations and parliamentary bureaux in the constituencies.</p>

Member State Chamber		2. Is it possible for the electorate to check what MPs declared and how they voted?
<p>Slovakia</p> <p>National Council</p>	<p>In principle sessions of the National Council are public,³⁹ public attendance is limited exclusively by the number of seats reserved for visitors that are available. No publication of any presentation of a Member made during a public session of the National Council may be restricted.</p> <p>A special database on legislative process is available on the website of the National Council (www.nrsr.sk) which contains all information relating to legislative process.</p>	<p>Declarations and voting results of MP's are published on the website of the National Council (www.nrsr.sk).</p>
<p>Slovenia</p> <p>National Assembly</p>	<p>Access by citizens to National Assembly's work is possible by visiting and observing the sessions of the National Assembly. Sessions of the National Assembly are broadcasted live; archive records of sessions are also available. Exceptionally, a meeting (or a part of a meeting) may be confidential and declared by the National Assembly to be closed to the public (Rules of Procedure, Article 101, paragraph 2).</p> <p>For each session of the National Assembly, a transcription and a verbatim record is prepared and available on the Internet.</p>	<p>Sessions of the National Assembly: votes are recorded by number and by name, so the full transparency is ensured.</p> <p>The record of votes by name is available on the Intranet on the same day (the link of a vote to a proposed item is made the following day). In case of vote by show of hands broadcasting makes individual votes transparent. Meetings of working bodies are broadcasted live. Transcriptions are prepared and available on Internet. The results of voting are recorded by number of votes. At the time of voting, the broadcast shows the sitting arrangement marked by a different colour for in favour/ against votes (so it is possible to see the vote by a person).</p>

³⁹ Closed sessions or parts of the session of the National Council are held during debates involving state, official or commercial secrets, or when it is specifically so provided by law, or due to other reasons when three fifths of all Members so resolve or in debates dealing with reports of special committees controlling the activities of the services performed by special regulations. **The sessions of the National Council where motions and bills dealing with the national budget, tax matters and fees are discussed shall be always open to the public.**

<p>Spain</p> <p>Congress of Diputies</p>	<p>Re Regarding the public character of debates, article 70 of the Standing Orders of the Congress of Deputies establishes that <i>"speeches shall be made personally and aloud, (...) from the rostrum or from his seat"</i>; <i>"no member may speak without having requested and obtained the right to do so from the Speaker"</i> and <i>"the powers for the organisation of debates is belong to the President of the Chamber"</i>.</p> <p>- As to the public character of votes, article 82(1) of the Standing Orders of the Congress of Deputies provides 4 types of voting (by assent to the Speaker's proposal; ordinary; public, by roll call; secret). All types of votes are public except the secret voting which cannot be used in legislative procedures or in cases in which agreements must be adopted on the criterion of weighted votes (article 85(1)).</p>	<p>Political groups meetings are not open to public.</p> <p>Yes, in the official gazette of the Spanish Parliament ("Boletín Oficial de las Cortes Generales") and in the website of the Congress of Deputies (www.congreso.es) citizens can access the diary of sessions which contains: the discussion, in which the deputies are involved defending or attacking the bill concerned with the respective arguments; and then the voting that shows the result of the votes by each parliamentary group.</p> <p>At the time of drafting this note, the Congress of Deputies is preparing the implement a new tool destined to enhance transparency by publishing in its website the votes of MPs by name in all plenary sessions. Thus the information of the vote of each MP in each of the subjects in the agenda will be made public.</p> <p>Once the tool is implemented, the results since the beginning of the X Legislature will be downloadable from www.congreso.es in an open data format.</p>
---	---	---

Member State Chamber		2. Is it possible for the electorate to check what MPs declared and how they voted?
<p>Sweden Riksdag</p>	<p>The debates are broadcast live on the Riksdag website, and on closed-circuit radio and television. All material is kept on file and can be searched for on the Riksdag website. It can also be ordered on VHS or DVD. Question Time on Thursdays as well as other debates of interest to the media are normally transmitted live by Swedish television. Swedish radio provides live coverage of major debates, such as debates between party leaders, budget debates and foreign policy debates. The general public can also listen in to Chamber debates by calling the "Riksdagen Direkt" audio response unit.</p>	<p>Debates in the Chamber are published in the parliamentary record, a preliminary version of which is printed the day after the debate. This is made possible partly by the Riksdag having stenographers who quickly edit the speeches. The final record appears in printed form a couple of weeks after the debate. In addition to the printed version, the record can be accessed through the Riksdag's website. The record includes everything occurring at a plenary meeting, e.g. voting figures by party. Anyone wishing to find out how individual members of the Riksdag have voted can visit the Riksdag website. It is also possible to get this information by calling the Riksdag Information Service. Further information: http://www.riksdagen.se/en/Documents-and-laws/</p>

Member State Chamber		2. Is it possible for the electorate to check what MPs declared and how they voted?
<p>United Kingdom</p> <p>House of Commons and House of Lords</p>	<p>A daily edited verbatim report of debates is published in print and electronically on the parliament website (free) at 6 am on the next working day. Also proceedings in the Commons Chamber are published on-line continuously while the House is sitting. These appear on-line three hours after they happen.</p> <p>As with the House of Commons, a daily edited verbatim report of debates (including division lists) is published in print and electronically on the parliament website (free) at 6 am on the next working day. Also proceedings are published on-line continuously while the House is sitting.</p> <p>Debates of both chambers are all televised, within a framework of broadcasting rules.</p>	<p>The names of Members and the way in which they voted is published as a list for all votes in the official report of debates (Hansard). There are available in hard copy or online.</p> <p>In addition, various non-parliamentary third-parties take the voting data and re-publish it on their websites, for example http://www.publicwhip.org.uk/index.php.</p> <p>Finally, Members are under an obligation to declare their interests for publication in the Register of Lords Interests (http://www.parliament.uk/mps-lords-and-offices/standards-and-interests/register-of-lords-interests/).</p>

6.3. Transparency measures in selected parliaments of non-EU states

Non-EU state		2. Is it possible for the electorate to check what MPs declared and how they voted?
<p>Andorra</p> <p>Consell General</p>	<p><u>Plenary:</u> As final votes of legislative procedures are electronic voting there is a high transparency of the political positions taken by Parliament. Apart from that, all votes are recorded in a report, in the sessions diary and in the video file.</p> <p><u>Committees:</u> Parliament committee meetings preparing a draft law are not open to the public. The rest are open, specially the question-answer sessions with ministers and other debates.</p> <p>All votes are recorded in the minutes.</p>	<p>Voting by show of hands is open for the public (video streaming) but individual votes are not recorded (see also supra for the modalities of voting).</p>
<p>Bosnia and Herzegovina</p> <p>House of Peoples and House of Representatives</p>	<p>Sessions of the House of Peoples/ Representatives are transmitted live on the web site of the Parliamentary Assembly of BiH – www.parlament.ba.</p> <p>Journalists always have free access to sessions, except when sessions are closed for public. Generally, interested parties including visitors, NGO members etc. have access to sessions upon their request and approval of the Secretary of the House of Peoples/ Representatives, having in mind that the available space in the hall where sessions of the House are taking place is limited.</p>	<p>Each voting in the Parliamentary Assembly of Bosnia and Herzegovina is public, except when the session is closed for public (as is the case with the House of Representatives). The voting results are published on the Parliament’s website the same day or 24 hours after the session. There is live streaming of sessions on the website of the Parliament. Audio recordings and transcript recordings of the sessions, as well as minutes, reports, parliamentary questions etc., are published on the Parliament’s website.</p>

Non-EU state		2. Is it possible for the electorate to check what MPs declared and how they voted?
<p>Canada House of Commons (Lower House)</p>	<p>Proceedings of the House of Commons are webcast and televised. The Debates of the House of Commons are also accessible online and in depository libraries throughout Canada. Most committee meetings are public and some are also webcast/broadcast, while others are held "in camera" [closed meetings]. Minutes of meetings can be consulted online and, in the case of public meetings, evidence is also available. Pre-internet committee documents can be consulted through depository libraries.</p>	<p>Through the Parliament's website, the electorate can access individual Members' profiles and see how they voted. The official voting record is also available through the Journals of the House of Commons online or in depository libraries.</p>
<p>Iceland Althingi</p>	<p>Voting results regarding a given issue are accessible on the parliament's website, where documents and verbatim records in chambers relating to the issue/case are issued.</p>	<p>Yes, voting results in the plenum are accessible on the parliament's website. Voting results are issued in terms of numerical results and names and can be in five categories: (i) MPs voting for, (ii) against, (iii) MPs who did not cast a vote, (iv) MPs absent with permission and (v) without permission. Two lists of voting results are issued in terms of parties and gender with the five categories.</p>
<p>Israel/ Knesset</p>	<p><u>Plenary</u>: The Knesset sittings are filmed and made available for viewing via electronic means to the general public. Plenary meetings are video streamed online and broadcast on the Knesset TV Channel. <u>Committees</u>: Minutes of meetings which are not confidential are open for public inspection and are usually published on the Knesset website. Some committee meetings are also video streamed online on the Knesset website and are broadcast on the Knesset TV Channel. <u>Political groups</u>: Meetings of are generally held in private.</p>	<p>Minutes taken at the sittings of the Knesset contain the course of all the proceedings, whatever is said orally, whether from the podium or from the designated places in the plenary hall, or as interjections, and the results of the votes. Minutes, as well as the detailed results of the electronic voting are published on the Knesset website.</p>

Non-EU state		2. Is it possible for the electorate to check what MPs declared and how they voted?
Macedonia	The public character of debates and votes is ensured through the presence of the public (the journalists) at the plenary sessions and at the committee meetings, as well as by means of live broadcasts of the sessions at the Assembly TV Channel and the delayed broadcasts of the Committee meetings.	After closing of the item on the agenda of the plenary session, the results of the vote, individually for each MP, is uploaded on the official Website of the Assembly.
Montenegro	In principle the work of the Parliament and its committees is public, and relevant data and information is posted on the Parliament's Website. Exceptions concern considering an act or material designated as a "state secret" and the meetings of the Security and Defence Committee. However, the Parliament may decide, without debate, to close the sitting or a part of the sitting for the public upon a reasoned proposal by the Government or 10 MPs. Television and other electronic media are entitled to direct broadcasting of the sittings of the Parliament and its Committees, and the Parliament has been providing conditions for such broadcast to take place. Moreover, coverages of sittings are made by reporters accredited by the competent authority.	Posting of the voting results of MPs on Parliament Website commenced in November of 2011. Aside from regular updates and live broadcasts of the parliamentary sittings and, partly, meetings of the working bodies, one of the novelties includes publishing of data on individual MP's voting results in the last three years. Publishing of listings from the previous year on the Parliamentary Website is planned to be released at the beginning of the next parliamentary session.

Non-EU state		2. Is it possible for the electorate to check what MPs declared and how they voted?
Switzerland Nationalrat and Ständerat	Plenary (but not in-committee) sessions of both chambers are public. The debates are video streamed on the <u>Internet</u> and published in full version in the Official Bulletin (<u>Amtliches Bulletin</u>).	The way MPs vote in Nationalrat is subject to full transparency. The numerical and nominal results of votes are published in the Official Bulletin (see in this respect also supra footnote 35). The electorate may consult the ballot data bank. Regarding the votes in Ständerat, only numerical and not nominal result is published in the Official Bulletin. Due to the "high" number of voters and the speed of the procedure of the voting by a show of hands, how individual Members vote is difficult to determine for the public and the press.
Turkey	<u>Plenary</u> : If it is not a secret meeting visitors are allowed to attend to the plenary meetings. The minutes of the sitting are printed and also are accessible on the internet. <u>Committees</u> : Committee meetings are not open to public. The prime minister or a minister may participate at the committee meetings or they may authorize a senior official to represent them in the committees. Standing committees may invite experts to present their views. In practice, the chair of a committee may invite related nongovernmental organizations representatives to committee meetings to hear them but this is not an obligation. <u>Political groups</u> : Meetings of political party groups are open to public. They are televised too.	To learn how a Deputy voted is possible only in the case of open votes. The information may be acquired by looking at the list which includes the vote of the deputies annexed to the minutes of that plenary sitting. For vote by show of hands and secret vote, it is not possible to determine the vote of the deputy. To learn what Deputies declared, one may read the verbatim minutes of the plenary sitting.

6.4. Measures employed by the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe

		<p>2. Is it possible for the electorate to check what MPs declared and how they voted?</p>
<p>Parliamentary Assembly</p>		<p>Yes. Official reports of debates are issued and Members' individual votes are also made public (they appear on the Assembly website).</p> <p>.</p>

REFERENCES

- Ezrow, L. (2004), *Linking Citizens to Parties. How Electoral Systems Matter for Political Representation*, Oxford University Press, New York.
- Herrnson, P.S. et al (2008), *Voting Technology. The Not-So-Simple Act of Casting a Ballot*, Brookings Institution Press, Washington D.C.
- Ilie, C. (2010), *European Parliaments under Scrutiny. Discourse strategies and interaction practices*, John Benjamins Publishing Company, Amsterdam/Philadelphia.
- Patzelt, W.J., Ch.Demuth, S.Dreischer, R. Messerschmidt, R. Schirmer, (2005), „Institutionelle Macht. Kategorien ihrer Analyse und Erklärung“, in: Patzelt, W.J. (ed.), *Parlamente und ihre macht. Kategorien und Fallbeispiele institutioneller Analyse*, Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden.
- *World e-Parliament Report 2008*, a joint project of the United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs and the Inter-Parliamentary Union through the Global Centre for ICT in Parliament, United Nations (2008).

DIRECTORATE-GENERAL FOR INTERNAL POLICIES

POLICY DEPARTMENT CITIZENS' RIGHTS AND CONSTITUTIONAL AFFAIRS C

Role

Policy departments are research units that provide specialised advice to committees, inter-parliamentary delegations and other parliamentary bodies.

Policy Areas

- Constitutional Affairs
- Justice, Freedom and Security
- Gender Equality
- Legal and Parliamentary Affairs
- Petitions

Documents

Visit the European Parliament website: <http://www.europarl.europa.eu/studies>

PHOTO CREDIT: iStock International Inc.

