

# ACM Transactions on the Web

## REVIEW FORM

Paper Title:

Authors:

Answers to questions 1-5 will be sent to authors. For [1..5], 1 is the lowest/poorest score while 5 is the highest score.

### 1) Presentation

Is the paper in the expected journal style? [y/n]

If not, please note what key sections or components are missing (abstract, related work, evaluation, references, etc).

Are the references comprehensive and appropriate? [y/n]

If key references are missing, please list them.

If there are too many self-citations, please suggest alternatives.

Relative to the subject material, is the paper understandable without requiring too much effort on the part of the reader? [y/n]

### 2) Content

Please rate the relevance of the paper to TWEB [1..5]

Is there enough new content in this paper to distinguish it from other works? [y/n] If the paper is an extended version of a conference paper, does the submission provide enough new material for journal publication? [y/n]

If the answer to either of these questions is no, please explain.

Manuscripts submitted to TWEB should not be concurrently under review for publication in another conference or journal. If you suspect that the same paper is simultaneously being considered for publication elsewhere, the editor should be notified.

Is the work primarily theoretical, practical or is it a survey? [t/p/s]

Is the content technically sound? [yes/no/unsure]

Please explain if not or if you are unsure.

**3) Impact**

Rate the level of originality and innovation of the work reported [1..5]  
Describe how the submission advances the state of the art in the field.

Rate the impact of this work on the research community [1..5]  
Suggest beneficiaries from the work.

Rate the impact of this work on the wider community [1..5]  
Suggest beneficiaries from the work.

**4) Public comments for the authors**

Please give the authors constructive feedback on their work.

**5) Recommendation**

[delete those which do not apply]

Accept

Accept with minor revisions

Revise and resubmit for further review

Reject

**6) Private comments to Editors**

Note that any comments in this section will not be shown to the authors.

## **NOTES FOR REVIEWERS**

Please remember that all materials submitted for consideration to ACM TWEB are confidential, and should not be distributed, shared, used or otherwise supplied to third parties prior to publication.

Tell the Editors if there is any conflict of interest in reviewing of the paper.

Please give the authors constructive comments which will assist them in improving the paper, even if the paper may never be suitable for TWEB.

Please respond within the allotted time so that we can give the authors timely responses and feedback.