



COMPENSATION  
FOR  
PERSONAL INJURY  
IN  
NEW ZEALAND

REPORT OF THE  
ROYAL COMMISSION OF INQUIRY

DECEMBER 1967



COMPENSATION  
FOR PERSONAL INJURY  
IN NEW ZEALAND

REPORT OF THE  
ROYAL COMMISSION OF INQUIRY

DECEMBER  
1967

BY AUTHORITY:  
R. E. OWEN, GOVERNMENT PRINTER, WELLINGTON, NEW ZEALAND—1967



THE ROYAL COMMISSION  
OF INQUIRY

CHAIRMAN

The Honourable Mr JUSTICE WOODHOUSE, D.S.C.

MEMBERS

H. L. BOCKETT, Esquire, C.M.G.

G. A. PARSONS, Esquire.

SECRETARY

J. L. WRIGHT



# TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Warrants	11
Letter of Transmittal	17
PART 1 - SUMMARY OF REPORT	19
PART 2 - INTRODUCTORY SURVEY	27
I Procedure .. .. .	27
II Plan of the Report .. .. .	29
III Scope of Inquiry .. .. .	30
IV The Present Position .. .. .	32
V The Beveridge Report .. .. .	36
The First Argument .. .. .	37
The Second and Third Arguments .. .. .	38
VI The Objectives for a Compensation System	39
Community Responsibility .. .. .	40
Comprehensive Entitlement .. .. .	40
Complete Rehabilitation .. .. .	40
Real Compensation .. .. .	40
Administrative Efficiency .. .. .	41
Conclusion .. .. .	41
PART 3 - THE COMMON LAW ACTION	42
VII General Form of the Action .. .. .	42
The History of Negligence .. .. .	42
The Standard of Care .. .. .	43
The Duty of Employers .. .. .	43
Contributory Negligence .. .. .	44
Breach of Industrial Statutes .. .. .	44
The Nature of Damages .. .. .	45
VIII Disadvantages of the Common Law Process	47
Short Conclusions .. .. .	48
The Fault Principle .. .. .	49
Deterrent Effect .. .. .	51
The Risks of Litigation .. .. .	52
The Influence of Juries .. .. .	56
Delays and Suspense .. .. .	57
Expense of the Process .. .. .	59
Lump Sum Awards .. .. .	60
The Issue of Rehabilitation .. .. .	61
Periodic Payments .. .. .	62

	Page
<b>IX The Attitude Overseas to the Damages Action</b>	63
The United Kingdom .. .. .	63
Canada .. .. .	64
United States .. .. .	65
<b>X Previous Discussion in New Zealand</b> ..	66
The Committee on Absolute Liability ..	66
Earlier Consideration .. .. .	67
<b>XI Views of Organisations and Persons Making Submissions</b> .. .. .	71
Should Work-connected Claims be Dealt With Separately .. .. .	75
<b>XII Conclusions Concerning the Damages Action</b>	77
PART 4 - STATUTORY COMPENSATION FOR INDUSTRIAL INJURY	
	78
<b>XIII The Workers' Compensation Act 1956</b> ..	79
The Insurance Question .. .. .	80
<b>XIV Disadvantages of the Workers' Compensation Act</b> .. .. .	81
Demarcation Problems .. .. .	81
Schedule Disabilities .. .. .	83
Adversary Procedures .. .. .	85
The Insurers .. .. .	87
Benefits Under the Act .. .. .	91
Double Compensation .. .. .	94
General .. .. .	96
<b>XV Conclusions Concerning the Workers' Compensation Act</b> .. .. .	97
PART 5 - THE SOCIAL SECURITY LEGISLATION	
	98
Double Compensation .. .. .	99
Conditions for Merger .. .. .	100
The Department's Proposal .. .. .	100
The Means Test .. .. .	102
Income-related Benefits .. .. .	103
A Unified Scheme .. .. .	104
Conclusion .. .. .	106
PART 6 - PROPOSALS FOR A COMPREHENSIVE SCHEME	
	107
<b>XVI General</b> .. .. .	107
Objective .. .. .	107
Approach .. .. .	107
Method .. .. .	108
Scope .. .. .	108

	Page
<b>XVII Persons to be Protected</b> .. .. .	109
Comprehensive Entitlement .. .. .	109
Age Limits .. .. .	109
Dependants of Living Beneficiaries .. .. .	110
Dependants of Deceased Persons .. .. .	110
New Zealand Residents Injured Overseas .. .. .	111
Visitors to New Zealand .. .. .	112
Special Groups .. .. .	112
<b>XVIII Contingencies to be Covered</b> .. .. .	113
General Principle .. .. .	113
Sickness and Disease .. .. .	114
<b>XIX Scope of Compensation</b> .. .. .	115
Basis of Benefits .. .. .	115
Proportion of Loss Covered .. .. .	115
Periodic Payments .. .. .	116
Hospital and Other Allowances .. .. .	117
Amount of Compensation .. .. .	117
<b>XX Level of Benefits</b> .. .. .	118
Effect of Taxation .. .. .	118
Calculation of Tax .. .. .	118
Assessment of Earnings .. .. .	119
Earnings of Self Employed .. .. .	119
Limits of Compensation .. .. .	119
Minor Incapacities .. .. .	120
Dependent Survivors .. .. .	121
Permanent Disabilities .. .. .	121
Severity Ratings .. .. .	122
Lump Sum Payments .. .. .	123
<b>XXI Administration</b> .. .. .	125
General .. .. .	125
An Independent Authority .. .. .	125
Assessment of Compensation and Review .. .. .	126
Procedure .. .. .	126
Rehabilitation and Safety .. .. .	127
<b>XXII Funds Required</b> .. .. .	129
Cost of Scheme .. .. .	129
Source of Funds .. .. .	129
Drivers of Vehicles .. .. .	130
Classification of Risks .. .. .	130
The Self Employed .. .. .	131
Scheme to be Compulsory .. .. .	131
<b>PART 7 - SAFETY AND REHABILITATION</b>	
<b>XXIII The Prevention of Accidents</b> .. .. .	132
The Statistics .. .. .	132
A Safety Department .. .. .	133
The National Safety Association .. .. .	133



	Page
Inspection and Enforcement .. ..	134
Merit Rating .. ..	134
Employers and the Trade Unions .. ..	136
Safety on the Roads .. ..	137
Other Accidents .. ..	138
Conclusion .. ..	139
<b>XXIV The Process of Rehabilitation .. ..</b>	<b>141</b>
The Objective .. ..	141
The Need .. ..	142
Assessment .. ..	143
The Doctor-Patient Relationship .. ..	146
The Ontario Experience .. ..	147
Medical Fees .. ..	149
The Chiropractors .. ..	150
Incentive .. ..	151
The Adversary System .. ..	152
The Risk of Abuse .. ..	154
Facilities .. ..	156
Role of the State .. ..	158
The Rehabilitation and Compensation	
Authority .. ..	159
Conclusion .. ..	160
	to be continued
<b>PART 8 - FINANCIAL PROVISIONS .. ..</b>	<b>163</b>
<b>XXV The Cost of the Scheme .. ..</b>	<b>163</b>
Allocation of Funds .. ..	163
Effect of Administration Expenses .. ..	165
Estimated Cost Ratio .. ..	166
The Ratio for Workers' Compensation In-	
surance .. ..	168
Calculation of Costs .. ..	169
<b>XXVI Source of Funds .. ..</b>	<b>171</b>
Contribution for Employees .. ..	172
Cost to the Government .. ..	173
The Self Employed .. ..	174
Motor Drivers .. ..	174
Method of Collecting Funds .. ..	175
Investment of Funds .. ..	175
<b>PART 9 - CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS .. ..</b>	<b>177</b>
Scope of Inquiry .. ..	177
Requirements of a Compensation Scheme .. ..	177
The Action for Damages .. ..	178
The Workers' Compensation Act .. ..	178
The Social Security System .. ..	179
A Unified Scheme .. ..	179
Consequential Changes .. ..	180
Scheme to be Compulsory .. ..	180
The Insurance Companies .. ..	180

	Page
Basis of Compensation .. .. .	181
Levels of Compensation .. .. .	181
Periodic Payments .. .. .	182
An Independent Authority .. .. .	183
Procedure .. .. .	183
Safety .. .. .	184
Rehabilitation .. .. .	184
International Labour Convention .. .. .	186
Source of Funds .. .. .	186

## APPENDICES

Appendix 1	Organisations and Persons Who Made Submissions .. .. .	189
” 2	Persons Interviewed During Commission’s Visit Overseas .. .. .	194
” 3	Letter to Interested Persons Before Final Hearings .. .. .	202
” 4	Bibliography .. .. .	203
” 5	Workers’ Compensation and Common Law Statistics .. .. .	218
” 6	Summary of Personal Injury Claims in Supreme Court at Wellington .. .. .	223
” 7	Comparing Compensation Costs as Maximum Compensation Levels are Increased .. .. .	225
” 8	Current Social Security Benefit Rates and Qualifications .. .. .	226
” 9	Calculations of Costs of Proposed Scheme .. .. .	228
” 10	Basis of Social Security Benefits in 120 Countries .. .. .	231
” 11	Schedule of Suggested Disability Percentages and Examples of Compensation Payments .. .. .	232
” 12	Motor Accident Statistics and Use of Safety Belts .. .. .	236



*Royal Commission to Inquire into and Report upon Workers' Compensation*

---

ELIZABETH THE SECOND, by the Grace of God of the United Kingdom, New Zealand, and Her Other Realms and Territories Queen, Head of the Commonwealth, Defender of the Faith:

To Our Trusty and Well-beloved the Honourable ARTHUR OWEN WOODHOUSE, D.S.C., a Judge of the Supreme Court of New Zealand; HERBERT LESLIE BOCKETT, Esquire, C.M.G., of Wellington, Retired Secretary of Labour; and GEOFFREY ARNOLD PARSONS, Esquire, of Wellington, Public Accountant:

GREETING:

KNOW Ye that We, reposing trust and confidence in your integrity, knowledge, and ability, hereby nominate, constitute, and appoint you, the said

The Honourable ARTHUR OWEN WOODHOUSE,  
HERBERT LESLIE BOCKETT, and  
GEOFFREY ARNOLD PARSONS

to be a Commission to receive representations upon, inquire into, investigate, and report upon the law relating to compensation and claims for damages for incapacity or death arising out of accidents (including diseases) suffered by persons in employment and the medical care, retraining, and rehabilitation of persons so incapacitated, and the administration of the said law, and to recommend such changes therein as the Commission considers desirable; and, in particular, to receive representations upon, inquire into, investigate, and report on the following matters:

1. Any need for change in the law relating to claims for compensation or damages in respect of persons incapacitated or killed in employment.

2. The institution and administration of a scheme for the payment of compensation or damages, in whole or in part, by periodic payments, in respect of persons incapacitated or killed in employment.

3. The desirability of adopting, in whole or in part or with suitable modifications, any scheme or system of compensation, medical care, retraining, and rehabilitation in operation in any other country which the Commission feels justified in investigating.

4. The relationship between money payable by way of compensation or allowances or damages in respect of persons incapacitated or killed in employment and money payable pursuant to legislation concerned with social security or welfare or pensions.

5. The desirability of amending the legislation to conform with the International Labour Convention (No. 121) Concerning Benefits in the Case of Employment Injury, and the International Labour Recommendation (No. 121) Concerning Benefits in the Case of Employment Injury.

6. The provision of facilities for medical examination of persons injured or incapacitated in employment, and their treatment, re-training, and rehabilitation.

7. Any amendment that should be made in the legislation to implement any changes recommended in respect of any of the above matters.

8. Any associated matters that the Commission may deem to be relevant to the objects of the inquiry.

And We hereby appoint you, the said

The Honourable ARTHUR OWEN WOODHOUSE  
to be Chairman of the said Commission:

And for the better enabling you to carry these presents into effect you are hereby authorised and empowered to make and conduct any inquiry or investigation under these presents in such manner and at such times and places as you deem expedient, with power to adjourn from time to time and place to place as you think fit, and so that these presents shall continue in force and the inquiry may at any time and place be resumed although not regularly adjourned from time to time or place to place:

And you are hereby strictly charged and directed that you shall not at any time publish or otherwise disclose, save to His Excellency the Governor-General, in pursuance of these presents or by His Excellency's direction, the contents or purport of any report so made or to be made by you or any evidence or information obtained by you in exercise of the powers hereby conferred upon you except such evidence or information as is received in the course of a sitting open to the public:

And it is hereby declared that the powers hereby conferred shall be exercisable notwithstanding the absence at any time of any one member hereby appointed so long as the Chairman, or a member deputed by the Chairman to act in his stead, and one other member are present and concur in the exercise of the powers:

And we do further ordain that you have liberty to report your proceedings and findings under this Our Commission from time to time if you shall judge it expedient so to do:

And, using all due diligence, you are required to report to His Excellency the Governor-General in writing under your hands not later than the 30th day of June 1967 your findings and opinions on the matters aforesaid, together with such recommendations as you think fit to make in respect thereof:

And, lastly, it is hereby declared that these presents are issued under the authority of the Letters Patent of His late Majesty King George the Fifth, dated the 11th day of May 1917, and under the authority of and subject to the provisions of the Commissions of Inquiry Act 1908, and with the advice and consent of the Executive Council of New Zealand.

In witness whereof We have caused this Our Commission to be issued and the Seal of New Zealand to be hereunto affixed at Wellington this 14th day of September 1966.

Witness Our Right Trusty and Well-beloved Cousin, Sir Bernard Edward Fergusson, Knight Grand Cross of the Most Distinguished Order of Saint Michael and Saint George, Knight Grand Cross in the Royal Victorian Order, Companion of the Distinguished Service Order, Officer of the Most Excellent Order of the British Empire, Brigadier on the Retired List of Her Majesty's Army, Governor-General and Commander-in-Chief in and over New Zealand; acting by and with the advice and consent of the Executive Council of New Zealand.

BERNARD FERGUSSON,  
Governor-General.

By His Excellency's Command—

J. R. MARSHALL, for the Prime Minister.

Approved in Council—

T. J. SHERRARD, Clerk of the Executive Council.

*Extending the Time Within Which the Royal Commission to Inquire into and Report Upon Workers' Compensation May Report*

ELIZABETH THE SECOND, by the Grace of God of the United Kingdom, New Zealand, and Her Other Realms and Territories Queen, Head of the Commonwealth, Defender of the Faith:

To Our Trusty and Well-beloved the Honourable ARTHUR OWEN WOODHOUSE, D.S.C., a Judge of the Supreme Court of New Zealand; HERBERT LESLIE BOCKETT, Esquire, C.M.G., of Wellington, Retired Secretary of Labour; and GEOFFREY ARNOLD PARSONS, Esquire, of Wellington, Public Accountant:

GREETING:

WHEREAS by Our Warrant dated the 14th day of September 1966, issued under the authority of the Letters Patent of His Late Majesty King George the Fifth dated the 11th day of May 1917, and under the authority of and subject to the provisions of the Commissions of Inquiry Act 1908, and with the advice and consent of the Executive Council of New Zealand, you were appointed to be a Commission to inquire into and report upon the matters in Our said Warrant set out being matters concerning workers' compensation:

And whereas by Our said Warrant you are required to report to His Excellency the Governor-General, not later than the 30th day of June 1967, your findings and opinions on the matters aforesaid, together with such recommendations as you might think fit to make in respect thereof:

And whereas it is expedient that the time for so reporting should be extended as hereinafter provided:

Now, therefore, We do hereby extend until the 31st day of December 1967, the time within which you are so required to report without prejudice to the continuation of the liberty conferred upon you by Our said Warrant to report your proceedings and findings from time to time if you should judge it expedient to do so:

And We do hereby confirm Our said Warrant and the Commission thereby constituted save as modified by these presents:

And it is hereby declared that these presents are issued under the authority of the said Letters Patent of His Late Majesty, and under the authority of and subject to the Commissions of Inquiry Act 1908, and with the advice and consent of the Executive Council of New Zealand.

In witness whereof We have caused these presents to be issued and the Seal of New Zealand to be hereunto affixed at Wellington this 14th day of June 1967.

Witness Our Right Trusty and Well-beloved Sir Bernard Edward Fergusson, Knight Grand Cross of the Most Distinguished Order of Saint Michael and Saint George, Knight Grand Cross of Our Royal Victorian Order, Companion of Our Distinguished Service Order, Officer of Our Most Excellent Order of the British Empire, Brigadier on the Retired List of Our Army, Governor-General and Commander-in-Chief in and over New Zealand; acting by and with the advice and consent of the Executive Council of New Zealand.

**BERNARD FERGUSSON,**  
Governor-General.

By His Excellency's Command—

**KEITH HOLYOAKE,** Prime Minister.

Approved in Council—

**T. J. SHERRARD,** Clerk of the Executive Council.





*Letter of Transmittal*

---

To HIS EXCELLENCY SIR ARTHUR ESPIE PORRITT, Baronet, Knight Grand Cross of the Most Distinguished Order of Saint Michael and Saint George, Knight Commander of the Royal Victorian Order, Commander of the Most Excellent Order of the British Empire, Governor-General and Commander-in-Chief in and over New Zealand.

May it please YOUR EXCELLENCY

Your Excellency's predecessor by Warrant dated 14 September 1966 appointed us the undersigned ARTHUR OWEN WOODHOUSE, HERBERT LESLIE BOCKETT, and GEOFFREY ARNOLD PARSONS, to report under the terms of reference stated in that Warrant.

We were originally required to present our report by 30 June 1967, but this date was extended to 31 December 1967.

We now humbly submit our report for Your Excellency's consideration.

We have the honour to be

Your Excellency's most obedient Servants,

A. O. WOODHOUSE, Chairman.  
H. L. BOCKETT, Member  
G. A. PARSONS, Member

Dated at Wellington this 13th day of December 1967.

